ATTACHMENT 76

Wilson, James August 29, 2013

I

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR
THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

IN RE: PROCESSED EGG PRODUCTS

ANTITRUST LITIGATION | MDL NO. 2002

______ 08-md-02002

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO

Publix Super Markets, Inc. v. HIGHLY

United Egg Producers, et al, | CONFIDENTIAL

No. 2:10-cv-06737-GP

Thursday, August 29, 2013

9:02 a.m.

Videotaped 30(b)(6) deposition of JAMES
WILSON, convened at the offices of Wasilewski
Court Reporting, LLC, 1525 S. Florida Avenue,
Ste. 4, Lakeland, Florida, pursuant to notice,
the proceedings being recorded stenographically
by Rita G. Meyer, RDR, CRR, CBC, CCP, Realtime
Reporter and Notary Public of the State of
Florida, and transcribed under her direction.

Henderson Legal Services, Inc. www.hendersonlegalservices.com

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

2 (Pages 2 to 5)

I			2 (1 uges 2 to 3)
	2		4
1	APPEARANCES:	1	INDEX
2	AI FLANANCES.	2	PAGE
3	DAVID P. GERMAINE, ESQUIRE and	3	VIDEOTAPED TESTIMONY OF JAMES WILSON
4	JOHN P. BJORK, ESQUIRE	4	Direct Examination by Mr. Schwingler9
5	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	5	Cross-Examination by Mr. Rayle252
6	Vanek, Vickers & Masini, PC	6	Cross-Examination by Mr. Germaine258
7	55 West Monroe Street, Ste. 3500	7	-
8	Chicago, IL 60603	8	Redirect Examination by Mr. Schwingler259
9	312-224-1500	9	
10	jbjork@vaneklaw.com	10	
11	Attorneys for Plaintiff Publix Super	11	
12	Markets, Inc.	12	
13	MEDDICK SCOTT DAVI E ESCUIDE	13	
14	MERRICK SCOTT RAYLE, ESQUIRE	14	
15	Lovell, Stewart, Halebian, Jacobson, LLP	15	
16	61 Broadway, Ste. 501	16	
17	New York, NY 10006	17	
18	415-533-5336	18	
19	msrayle@sbeglobal.net	19	
20	Attorney for the Indirect Purchaser	20	
21	Plaintiffs,	21	
22		22	
22		**	
	3		5
1	APPEARANCES:	1	EXHIBITS
2		2	Description PAGE
3	PETER J. SCHWINGLER, ESQUIRE	3	Exhibit Wilson 1 Notice of Deposition14
4	Leonard, Street and Deinard	4	Exhibit Wilson 2 PUB_EGGS_02050235
5	150 South Fifth Street, Ste. 2300	5	Exhibit Wilson 3 PUB_EGGS-02068556
6	Minneapolis, MN 55402	6	Exhibit Wilson 4 PUB_EGGS_02048060
7	612-335-7023	7	Exhibit Wilson 5 PUB_EGGS_02049168
8	peter.schwingler@leonard.com	8	Exhibit Wilson 6 PUB_EGGS_02048374
9	Attorney for Defendant Michael Foods, Inc.	9	Exhibit Wilson 7 PUB_EGGS_02050278
10	and Papetti's Hygrade Egg Products, Inc.	10	Exhibit Wilson 8 Answers to Interrogatories106
11		11	Exhibit Wilson 9 PUB_EGGS_006998 - 007024121
12	KARRI ALLEN, ESQUIRE (By Telephone)	12	Exhibit Wilson 10 PUB_EGGS_008209 - 008230130
13	Porter, Wright, Morris & Arthur, LLP	13	Exhibit Wilson 11 PUB_EGGS_016558146
14	1919 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Ste. 500	14	Exhibit Wilson 12 PUB_EGGS_006959 - 006997148
15	Washington, DC 20006-3434	15	Exhibit Wilson 13 PUB_EGGS_007150 - 007157154
16	202-778-3056	16	Exhibit Wilson 14 PUB_EGGS_008645 - 008659161
17	kallen@porterwright.com	17	Exhibit Wilson 15 PUB_EGGS_008095186
18	Attorney for Defendant Rose Acre Farms, Inc.	18	Exhibit Wilson 16 PUB_EGGS_011761, 011762187
19	,	19	Exhibit Wilson 17 PUB_EGGS_008104 - 008107196
20		20	Exhibit Wilson 18 PUB_EGGS_012963207
21		21	Exhibit Wilson 19 PUB_EGGS_006846 - 006851210
22		22	_

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

3 (Pages 6 to 9)

	6	8
1	EXHIBITS, con't	¹ witness and Publix Super Markets.
2	Description PAGE	² MR. SCHWINGLER: Is anybody on the line?
3	Exhibit Wilson 20 PUB_EGGS_007158 - 007182212	³ MR. GERMAINE: I heard one person join.
4	Exhibit Wilson 21 PUB_EGGS_006505 - 006507227	MS. ALLEN: Yes, This is Karri Allen from
5	Exhibit Wilson 22 PUB_EGGS_011786 - 011788230	5 Porter Wright on behalf of Rose Acre Farms.
6	Exhibit Wilson 23 PUB_EGGS_011856- 011857234	6 MR. GERMAINE: And for the Record, the
7	Exhibit Wilson 24 PUB_EGGS_011874 - 011877236	videographer introduced the deposition as the
8	Exhibit Wilson 25 PUB_EGGS_015055 w/attachment255	8 deposition of James Wilson, but we are
9		9 proceeding as a 30(b)6 deposition of Publix
10		¹⁰ today.
11		¹¹ MR. SCHWINGLER: Yes. Are we ready?
12	STIPULATIONS	12 (Mr. Rayle enters the deposition)
13	It is hereby stipulated and agreed between	MR. SCHWINGLER: One more. Go off the
14	counsel for the respective parties and the witness	Record for two seconds.
15	that the reading and signing of the deposition be	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 9:05, we're
16	RESERVED.	going off the Record.
17		17 (Proceedings recessed at 9:05 a.m.)
18		¹⁸ (Proceedings resumed at 9:09 a.m.)
19		¹⁹ THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 9:09. We're
20		back on the Record.
21		MR. SCHWINGLER: Mr. Rayle, could you
22		note your appearance?
	7	9
1	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Good morning. My	¹ MR. RAYLE: Merrick Rayle for the
2	name is Rick Spector, and I'm the	² Indirect Purchaser Plaintiffs.
3	videographer appearing on behalf of Henderson	³ MR. SCHWINGLER: Okay.
4	Legal Services, Inc. We're here at the	⁴ JAMES WILSON,
5	office of Wasilewski Court Reporting, LLC,	5 having been first duly sworn, testified as
6	1525 South Florida Avenue, Lakeland, Florida.	⁶ follows:
7	This matter is before the United States	DIRECT EXAMINATION
8	District Court for the Eastern District of	⁸ BY MR. SCHWINGLER:
9	Pennsylvania in regard to Processed Egg	⁹ Q. Mr. Wilson, my name is Pete Schwingler.
10	Products Antitrust Litigation. The case	I represent Michael Foods, which is a Defendant in
11	number is MDL 2002 08-md-02002.	this lawsuit.
12	This is the deposition of James Wilson.	Could you state and spell your name for
13	Today is Thursday, August 29th, 2013 and the	the Record, please?
14	time is 9:04 in the morning. At this time,	A. James Wilson. J-A-M-E-S. W-I-L-S-O-N.
15	I'll ask the attorneys to please introduce	Q. Could you describe your educational
16	themselves, stating the parties whom they	background, starting with high school?
17	represent.	A. I have a high school diploma, 12th
19	MR. SCHWINGLER: Peter Schwingler on	grade, and then my AA degree from rananassee
	behalf of Defendant Michael Foods.	Community Conege.
20	MR. GERMAINE: David Germaine on behalf	Q. Have you ever had your deposition taken
22	of the witness and Publix Super Markets.	Delote:
	MR. BJORK: John Bjork on behalf of the	A. One time before.
1		

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

4 (Pages 10 to 13)

10 12 Q. What was the subject matter of that Q. Beer. What are your job deposition? responsibilities in your current position? A. Slip and fall. A. That's a very broad question. I mean, I Q. I'll just go over some background, even though you've done this once before. The most Q. What would you do on a typical day in important thing is that you listen carefully to my your current position? questions and answer truthfully. If you don't A. Talk to people. I mean, it's a very understand my question or if you can't hear me, broad question. I have many, many, many please let me know and I'll either try to rephrase responsibilities as a buyer. 10 10 Q. Would part of your responsibilities or we'll have the court reporter read the question 11 11 back to you. But if you answer my questions, I'm include communicating with suppliers? 12 12 going to assume that you heard me and understood A. Yes. 13 13 the questions. Is that fair? Q. And would your responsibilities include 14 14 A. Yes, sir. communicating with others within Publix about the 15 15 Q. It's important for the court reporter's product that you are considering? 16 benefit that only one of us speak at a time so A. Yes. 17 17 we're not speaking over each other. And it's also Q. How long have you had your current 18 18 important that you answer the questions audibly title? 19 19 A. I've been a buyer since 2007. with words like yes or no, rather than mm-hmm or 20 20 uhn-uhn. Q. Have you been a buyer with respect to 21 21 If you need a break, just let me know beer since 2007? 22 22 A. No. and we'll take a break. The only exception is 11 13 that we try not to break while a question is Q. Since 2007, what products have you pending. Who will be voicing objections? been -- for what products have you served as a MR. GERMAINE: I will. buyer? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: A. Eggs, butters, biscuits, the Q. Mr. Germaine may voice an objection from refrigerated biscuit. Dough, cream cheese, 6 time to time. Unless he instructs not to answer, refrigerated desserts. then you should answer the question unless I Q. During what period did you serve as the 8 withdraw it. buyer for eggs? 9 9 A. From 2007 until, um, February of this And the most important thing is that you 10 listen carefully and answer truthfully. Is there 11 any reason you can't do that today? 11 Q. When you say eggs, does that include 12 12 shell eggs? A. No. 13 13 Q. Mr. Wilson, who is your current A. Yes, sir. 14 employer? 14 Q. Does that also include refrigerated egg 15 15 A. Publix Super Markets. substitutes such as Egg Beaters? 16 16 Q. How long have you been worked for A. Yes, sir. 17 17 Publix? Q. Are you aware that Publix has filed a 18 18 A. Twenty-five years. lawsuit against a number of entities, including 19 Q. What is your current title? 19 the United Egg Producers, United States Egg 20 20 Marketers and a number of egg producers? A. Buyer. 21 Q. And what, what is it that you buy? A. According to the documents, yes, sir. A. Currently, beer. Q. What is your understanding of the

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

5 (Pages 14 to 17)

14 16 allegations in the lawsuit? A. No, sir. A. That the United Egg Producers, the UEP, Q. And will you be testifying about the manufacturing business unit? formed an alliance to, um, hinder the production of eggs. A. No, sir. MR. SCHWINGLER: This would be Exhibit Q. So you'll only be testifying about 1. This will be Wilson Exhibit 1. grocery; is that correct? A. Yes, sir. (Wilson 1 Received and Marked) BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. What did you do to prepare for the Q. Mr. Wilson, I'm showing you what has deposition today? 10 10 been marked as Wilson Exhibit 1. Have you seen A. Met with other people with Publix Super 11 11 Markets on their -- with respect to their this document before? 12 12 A. Yes, sir. expertise. 13 13 Q. What is this document? Q. Who did you meet with? 14 A. It is the Defendant's notice of 14 A. Maria Brous, James Lucas, Greg Bates, 15 15 Deposition to Plaintiff Publix Super Markets, Kevin Ralph. 16 16 Incorporated, pursuant to Federal RCP 30(b)6. Q. Starting with Maria Brous, what did you 17 17 Q. If you flip to page 9, the bottom of speak -- who is Maria Brous? 18 18 page 9, do you see where it says "deposition A. Maria Brous works for our community 19 affairs. topics"? 20 20 Q. What is her responsibilities? A. Yes, sir. 21 21 Q. Have you reviewed the, I believe, 30 A. She deals with newspapers and community 22 affairs issues. numbered deposition topics that, that follow that 15 17 Q. What did you speak to Ms. Brous about? heading? A. Yes, sir, I think I have. A. About issues with community affairs. Q. And do you understand that you'll be Q. Would that include newspapers that testifying on Publix's behalf today on all 30 of Publix receives? those topics or at least the 30 that your counsel A. Newspapers that Publix receives, no, 6 has, through me, conferred in negotiations with sir. us, decided to move forward with today? Q. So what do you mean by community A. Yes, sir. 9 Q. I understand that you'll only be A. Questions that communities would --10 10 testifying with respect to a certain part of people in the community would ask Publix. 11 11 Publix's business. Can you explain to me what Q. Would that include animal welfare, 12 12 part of Publix's business you'll be testifying activist groups such as PETA or the Humane 13 13 about today? Society? 14 A. The grocery retail. 14 A. Yes, sir. 15 15 Q. And can you describe briefly what, what Q. Who is James Lucas? 16 the grocery retail business is? A. He was my supervisor. 17 17 A. Shell eggs and egg substitutes. Q. When you were a buyer? 18 18 Q. And egg substitutes. Will you be A. For the eggs when I first came to the 19 19 testifying today about the deli business unit? business, yes, sir. 20 20 A. No, sir. Q. Is he still in that role now? 21 21 Q. Will you be testifying about the bakery A. No, sir. business unit? Q. What is his current role?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

6 (Pages 18 to 21)

18 20 A. He's category manager for another opportunity to finish the answer to that business unit. previous question. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. What did you speak to Mr. Lucas about? A. We just went over issues that we had Q. Sure. Apart from Ms. Brous, Mr. Luke, dealt with when we were on the desk together. Mr. Bates and Mr. Ralph, did you speak with anyone Q. Issues related to the acquisition of else preparing for the deposition today? A. Counsel. shell eggs? Q. Other than counsel, did you speak with A. Yes, sir. Q. And liquid egg substitutes? anyone else? 10 10 A. Yes, sir. A. No, sir. 11 Q. Who is Greg Bates? Q. Have you discussed this deposition with 12 12 anyone other than the counsel and the four people A. Greg Bates was the category manager 13 13 before I got into the office. that you mentioned? 14 14 A. No, sir. Q. Did you speak with him on the same 15 15 topics you spoke to Mr. Lucas? Q. So I'll try to be precise with the 16 A. Yes, sir. timing or the, I guess the temporal scope of the 17 17 Q. And I'm sorry, I missed the fourth name questions, what years we're referring to. Most of 18 18 the questions you can assume, unless I state that you had mentioned. 19 A. Kevin Ralph. otherwise, that we're discussing the period 20 20 between January 1st, 1999 and December 31st, 2008. Q. Who is Kevin Ralph? 21 A. He worked for MSP at the time. But we will try to identify what time period we're Q. Who is MSP? talking about as we go along. If you have any 19 21 A. MSP does all of our acquisitions for questions about what time period we're talking private label products. about, please don't hesitate to ask. Q. Is MSP a broker? Mr. Wilson, can you identify all of A. No, sir. Works for Publix. Publix's business units that purchase shell eggs? Q. Is it part of Publix? A. Publix business units. Grocery retail. A. Yes, sir. Bakery. Deli. We're not talking about those Q. So MSP is a division or unit within today. We're just talking about grocery retail. Publix? We covered that earlier. A. Yes, sir. Q. Correct. Yes. Beyond the bakery and 10 Q. Not a separate company? deli units and the grocery retail unit that you're 11 11 A. No, sir. testifying about, are you aware of any other 12 12 Q. I'm going to try to be precise about Publix business units that purchase shell eggs? 13 13 the --A. I don't work with those units, so --14 14 MR. GERMAINE: I'm sorry. Pardon the Q. So you don't know? 15 15 interruption. I don't think the witness was A. No, sir. 16 completely done with his answer before to the Q. Okay. 17 17 question of who he met with in preparation A. There is one other person I talked to 18 18 for his deposition. about this, though. 19 19 MR. SCHWINGLER: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. Who is that? 20 20 A. CQA. Head of CQA. Mike Roberson. MR. GERMAINE: I just, I think we started moving quickly. He may have been, I Q. What is CQA? don't know. I just want to give him an A. Corporate Quality Assurance.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

7 (Pages 22 to 25)

22 24 Q. What is CQA in charge of or responsible substitutes for the grocery business unit, have for? responsibility for purchasing the liquid egg substitute that becomes the Publix brand liquid A. Quality assurance. Q. Is that with respect to the products egg substitute? that Publix buys or the products that Publix A. It's under our buyer number and there's sells? a lot of different -- I mean, like, CQA looks at the product before we make a decision to insure A. Both. Q. Both. So CQA would -- can you just that it meet or exceeds national brand. describe briefly for me what -- how CQA interacts Q. Sure. The -- but the decision would be 10 10 with the buyer? the buyer's decision; is that correct? 11 11 A. They, they just -- they insure that we A. Well, yes, sir. 12 12 get the highest quality products. They test Q. I apologize if I asked this before, but 13 13 products to make sure they are of the highest does Publix's grocery retail business unit 14 14 quality. purchase shell eggs? 15 15 Q. Would that include taste testing? A. Yes, sir. 16 A. Yes, sir. Q. Are there any other names that the 17 17 Q. If there -- does CQA have authority to grocery retail business unit goes by? 18 18 overrule a buyer on which supplier to use for a A. No. sir. 19 19 given product? Q. So when I refer to the grocery unit or 20 20 A. It doesn't work that way. We work the grocery retail unit, you understand me to mean 21 21 the division within Publix that buys shell eggs together. 22 Q. So when you say you work together, CQ -and puts them in stores and ultimately sells them 23 25 is CQA a source of information for the buyer? to customers? A. Yes, sir. A. Yes, sir. Q. Who has ultimate authority to decide Q. When Publix grocery unit purchases shell which supplier to use? eggs, does it purchase them for retail sale? A. The authority? The customer when they A. Yes, sir. 6 vote. Customers buy products. That's the Q. Does it also purchase shell eggs for products that we want to sell to them. distribution to other companies? Q. Sure. Would the buyer for eggs and the A. No, sir. 9 Q. Does it purchase -- does the grocery grocery retail unit be responsible for buying 10 10 Publix brand liquid egg substitute? business unit purchase shell eggs to be used in 11 A. Would the buyer for Publix -- repeat 11 Publix-made products? 12 12 A. The grocery retail unit? that question. 13 13 Q. Sure. Let me ask it a different way. Q. Yes, sir. 14 Does Publix sell its own brand of retail liquid 14 A. No, sir. 15 15 Q. So the only reason the grocery retail egg substitute? 16 16 A. We do have our own brand, yes, sir. unit would purchase shell eggs would be to turn 17 17 Q. And does Publix make that, itself? around and resell them as shell eggs to a 18 18 A. No, sir. customer. 19 19 Q. Publix buys that product from a A. Yes, sir. 20 20 supplier, correct? Q. Is that also true for retail liquid egg 21 21 A. Yes, sir. substitutes? Q. Does the buyer of eggs and liquid egg A. For the grocery retail unit, yes, sir.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

8 (Pages 26 to 29)

26 28 A. Okay. Q. Does the grocery retail unit purchase egg products? Q. What employees within the grocery unit A. Egg products? Like liquid eggs? are responsible for shell egg procurement Q. Do you understand that this lawsuit involves both shell eggs and egg products? A. The buyer, the category manager and the A. What type of egg products are you business development director. BDD. talking about? We talked about liquid eggs. Q. For large -- withdrawn. That's an egg product. Who has the ultimate responsibility for Q. I'm just looking, before I go any a purchasing decision? 10 10 further, for your understanding, if you have any, A. The business development director. 11 11 of what the term egg products means for purposes Q. And is that -- when you were the buyer 12 12 of this litigation. for eggs, did you report to the business 13 13 A. Can you explain it to me? development director? 14 14 Q. Does Publix -- let me ask a different A. Yes, sir. 15 15 question. Does Publix's grocery unit purchase Q. And who, who was the business 16 16 unpasteurized liquid eggs? development director, if you know, in 2002? 17 17 A. No, sir. A. 2002, I think it was Dan Maloney. Best 18 18 Q. Does Publix's grocery business unit of my knowledge, it was Dan Maloney. 19 19 Q. Between 2002 and December 31st of 2008, purchase dried egg whites? 20 20 was Mr. Maloney always the business development A. Um, I'm sure there are dried egg whites 21 21 on the baking aisle. I'm sure there are. 22 22 MR. GERMAINE: Director. Q. And would those dried egg whites be sold 27 29 at retail to a customer? A. Business development director. Before A. Yes. him was Dave Cerra. It could've been Dave Cerra, Q. Publix doesn't use them to then make a but I don't know exactly when they changed different product? positions, so --A. Once again, we're talking about the Q. Was anybody other than Dave Cerra or -grocery business unit. I don't know if another A. Dan Maloney. business unit uses them or not. I don't work in Q. Or Dan -- is it Maloney or Malone? those units. A. Maloney. Q. Or than Mr. Cerra or Mr. Maloney, the Q. But for the grocery unit, they would not 10 take dried egg whites and make a different product business development director between 2002 and the 11 11 year end of 2008? out of it? 12 A. We don't make prepared foods, so, no, 13 13 sir. Q. Within the grocery retail unit, who was 14 14 Q. Okay. So just for, for, I guess ease of responsible for selecting which supplier to 15 15 reference, when I'm referring to egg products, I'm purchase from? 16 16 referring to a product that is made from a shell A. Um, that would be the, the business 17 17 unit. Between the BDD, the category manager and egg. Whether it's dried egg whites or a liquid yolk or -- I'm not referring to mayonnaise or the buyer to make that decision. 19 19 something where the egg is, you know, used to make Q. Okay. Who within the grocery retail 20 20 unit, was responsible for negotiating prices with some sort of a higher value-added food product. I'm just referring to, something more along the egg suppliers? A. That's mainly the buyer. lines of a dried egg or a, or a liquid egg.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

9 (Pages 30 to 33)

30 32 Q. So the business development director market prices? would be involved in decisions regarding which A. No, sir. suppliers to use; is that correct? Q. I know it may be a long list, so let's just stick with sort of the major suppliers. Can A. Yes. Q. But would not be involved in the you identify the entities that supplied a grocery day-to-day price negotiations? retail unit with shell eggs? A. For the most part, no, sir. A. Currently? Q. You can start with currently and we can Q. If there was a discussion as to what type of pricing structure to use when purchasing work backwards if that works. 10 10 shell eggs as opposed to just the price on a given A. Currently, we have Cal-Maine and Country 11 11 day, would the business development director be Charm. 12 12 involved in that discussion? Q. What percentage of Publix's shell eggs 13 13 MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. do those two entities collectively supply? 14 14 A. Publix's shell eggs? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 15 15 Q. Do you understand what I mean by pricing Q. Yeah? 16 structure? A. A hundred percent. 17 17 A. Can you explain it to me? Q. A hundred percent. So those are the 18 18 Q. Sure. So when I say pricing structure, only two shell egg suppliers Publix currently 19 I'm talking about the mechanism by which the eggs uses? 20 20 are priced. For example, whether it's a discount A. From grocery retail, yes, sir. 21 21 off of the market price or a fixed price that Q. And what entities supply the grocery 22 22 exists for a year and doesn't change or a price retail unit with retail liquid egg substitutes? 31 33 that's based off of grain. There's a number of A. ConAgra has the account for Publix different ways to do it. brand. Sort of how the price is determined. Do Q. So ConAgra has the store brand? vou understand that? A. Yes, sir. A. I didn't know there was a multiple way Q. Have they always had the store brand? to do eggs, no, sir. A. As far as I know, yes, sir. Q. What, in your understanding, is the way Q. Does ConAgra also sell liquid branded eggs are priced? egg substitutes? A. Off of the Urner Barry. A. Yes, sir. 10 Q. Is that the Egg Beaters brand? Q. By Urner -- what is Urner Barry? 11 A. That's a shell egg market; liquid egg 11 A. Yes, sir. 12 12 market. Also, they price eggs or they set a cost Q. Does Publix purchase any competing 13 every day. products to the ConAgra product? 14 Q. So they report the prevailing market 14 A. Yes, sir. 15 15 price for shell eggs on a daily basis? Q. What would those be? 16 16 A. And liquid eggs. A. Papetti's. 17 17 Q. And liquid eggs. Okay. So you're not Q. And do you understand that Papetti's is 18 aware of any way to purchase shell eggs other than part of Michael Foods? 19 19 off of the Urner Barry market? A. Yes, sir. 20 20 Q. What product does Papetti's sell to A. Not that I'm aware of, no, sir. 21 21 Q. Are you aware of whether Publix Publix? considered other ways to purchase eggs other than A. All Whites.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

10 (Pages 34 to 37)

34 36 Q. Does Papetti's also sell the Better'n page of one of the tabs in that document so we Eggs product? could see what the column headers were along the A. Yes, sir. top. Do you see the column headers I'm referring Q. I understand that Publix produced its transactional data for the grocery retail unit in A. Yes. about 15 separate Excel files. If you know, can Q. Can you explain to me what PO number you explain the reason for that? A. That's the purchase order number. A. No, sir. Q. And you do not know? Q. And so would a PO number refer to a 10 10 A. No, sir. specific invoice? 11 11 Q. Three of the files have been identified MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. 12 12 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: by counsel as grocery purchasing-warehouse files. 13 13 Do you understand what grocery Q. Can you explain to me what a purchase 14 14 purchasing-warehouse means? order number is? 15 15 A. I can assume it would mean our grocery A. That's the, the order that logistics 16 16 purchasing warehouses. places on the invoice when it goes out to the 17 17 Q. So would these -- would that be data, supplier. 18 18 then, that relates to -- what do you mean by a Q. So every time Publix buys whatever this 19 19 warehouse? product is, Egg Beaters twin pack, would a new 20 20 A. Where product is stored before it goes purchaser order number be generated? 21 21 to the store. 22 22 Q. So can you, if you know, can you walk me Q. Can you explain to me what item code 35 37 through the process by which a shell egg would get means? from the supplier to the grocery aisle in front of A. That's our internal code for the the customer? product. A. That's a direct ship product. That Q. For a given product, will a given doesn't go to our warehouse, so that comes from product have the same item code -- withdrawn. the supplier to our store. If, for a given item code, for example, Q. Okay. Is that always the case? 67015, will that code always refer to the same product? A. Yes, sir. Q. What about retail liquid egg A. Yes. 10 substitutes? Would those go to the warehouse? Q. So if you look at item code 67015, you 11 A. Yes, sir. 11 know that that entry is always referring to the 12 12 Q. They would. All right. Exhibit 2, I Egg Beaters twin pack 16-ounce product that's 13 13 listed on this sheet. believe. 14 14 (Wilson 2 Received and Marked) A. Yes. 15 15 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Received date, can you tell me what that 16 16 Q. So what I've handed you, Mr. Wilson, is column means? 17 17 A. That's the date it was received in the marked as Exhibit 2. And I'll represent for the Record, so you know what we're looking at, this warehouse. 19 19 is, this is essentially a, a print out of the Q. The date the product was received? 20 20 first page of the Excel spreadsheet that was 21 produced at Bates number PUB_EGGS_020502. It's, Q. And the column that's says item and then it's -- essentially, we created a PDF of the first DESC, can you explain to me what that column is?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

11 (Pages 38 to 41)

38 40 A. The item description column. Q. The column TOT cases and then RCVD. Q. Is that what item DESC refers to? That column, what does that mean? A. Yes. Total cases received. Q. Item description? Q. And what does that represent? A. Yes. A. The number of cases ordered on the PO. Q. What is, what is the item description? Q. The case cost column, what does that A. Egg Beaters twin pack, in this case. represent? Q. The item pack column, what does that The cost of the case. refer to? Q. So for this order, if it says there's 10 10 A. How many units are in the case. 240 total cases received, the total order was 240 11 11 Q. The units of measure column, am I cases of 12, twin packs of the Egg Beaters 12 12 correct that that refers to the, in this case, the product? 13 13 volume of the unit? A. Yes. 14 14 A. Yes. Q. And the cost for each, each of those 240 15 15 Q. So we're looking at a 16-ounce carton of cases was \$22.20; is that correct? 16 Egg Beaters on this, on this spreadsheet? A. Yes. 17 17 A. It appears it's two 8-ounce cartons, but Q. And the total invoice cost, can you 18 18 it's a 16-ounce unit. explain what that means? Q. Because it's a twin pack? A. That's your total cases received times 20 20 A. Yes. the case cost. 21 21 Q. The vendor NUM column, can you explain Q. So is it true that for, for all entries 22 22 what that means? on this spreadsheet, if you multiply the number in 39 41 A. Vendor number. the total cases received column, by the number in Q. And what, what is the vendor number? the case cost column, that will equal the total A. It's the number assigned to that vendor. invoice cost? Q. So for a given vendor number, for A. Yes. example, number 338601, that is referring to a Q. Is there any reason that total invoice specific company that supplies Publix with some cost would not equal the product of the total cases received times the case cost? product? A. With this product. A. There was an error. Q. With this product. So in this case --Q. Turning back to the case cost, does this 10 well, but if I, if I see 338601 under the vendor column reflect shipping costs? 11 number column, will that always be referring to 11 A. Yes. 12 12 the same company? Q. It does. So the price that Publix paid 13 13 A. Yes. for this product included the shipping cost. 14 Q. Okay. And then the vendor name column, 14 There wasn't a separate charge. That wouldn't be 15 15 can you explain what that is? on this sheet. 16 16 A. That's the vendor name for the, the A. No. 17 17 vendor number. Q. Does the case cost column include any 18 18 Q. That's who the vendor is? discounts that Publix may have received for the 19 19 product? A. Yes. 20 20 Q. So here ConAgra Dairy, that's the MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. 21 21 supplier that is supplying item code 67015? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: A. Yes. Q. Let me try again. Does Publix ever

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

12 (Pages 42 to 45)

42 44 receive a discount from a supplier of shell eggs? think is going to throw him for a loop. A. Not for Publix products. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Sure. Can you just identify one Q. What do you mean by Publix products? A. Products with Publix's name on them. non-Publix brand shell egg that Publix stores Q. What about other branded products? MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. A. Eggland's Best. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Eggland's Best. Any others? Q. Does Publix ever receive a discount from A. Four Grain. 9 a supplier for purchases of non-Publix branded Q. So assume that the supplier of the -- of 10 shell eggs? 10 Four Grain shell eggs to Publix would like Publix 11 11 A. Yes. to reduce the retail price of that product. How 12 12 Q. Can you give me an example of what such -- I just need you to explain to me the process by 13 13 a discount would be? which the total off allowance comes into being. 14 14 A. Total off allowance. Does the supplier initiate the conversation with 15 15 Q. And what is total off allowance? Publix? A. That's an amount off per case. MR. GERMAINE: Object to the form. 17 17 Q. And how is that negotiated? A. Yes. 18 18 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: A. They generally send us a deal sheet with 19 19 a total off allowance on it. Q. So Publix would not pick up the phone 20 20 Q. How frequently does Publix receive a and call the supplier, Four Grain, and say, how 21 21 about we do a total off allowance? total off allowance? 22 22 A. As frequently as suppliers want to MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. You 43 45 receive a cost or price break on the shipment. can answer. Q. So the total off allowance is something A. Um, I'm not going to say it would never that a supplier would do in order to cause Publix happen, but generally, no. to lower the retail price for that product that BY MR. SCHWINGLER: the customer is paying? Q. When a supplier gives Publix a total off A. Yes. allowance, that results in a lower price paid by Q. And that -- would this include shell Publix, correct? A. Yes. eggs? A. The branded shell eggs? Q. How much of that lower price, if you Q. Yeah. know, does Publix pass on to the retail customer? 11 A. Yes, sir. 11 MR. GERMAINE: I'm going to object to 12 12 Q. So, for example, if Publix was charging the form of the question. It calls for 13 13 \$1.50 a dozen for Cal-Maine branded Grade A large downstream testimony. We objected to that 14 shell eggs, and Cal-Maine wanted, for whatever 14 topic in the notice. The witness can answer 15 reason, to have Publix lower that price, Cal-Maine to the extent he knows in an individual 16 would offer or would send Publix a total off capacity. 17 17 allowance, which would give Publix a lower price A. It depends. 18 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: that it was paying for those eggs? 19 19 MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. Q. When you say it depends, what factors 20 20 does Publix consider when deciding how much of the MR. SCHWINGLER: That may have been 21 confusing. What I'm trying to -cost savings to pass on to the customer? MR. GERMAINE: Cal-Maine branded is -- I MR. GERMAINE: I'm just going to insert

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

13 (Pages 46 to 49)

46 48 an ongoing downstream objection. I don't A. Yes. need to make that every time. Q. And they vary from circumstance to MR. SCHWINGLER: That's fine. circumstance? A. There's, there's hundred of different A. Yes. factors involved. Q. Meaning, on July 1st, Publix might BY MR. SCHWINGLER: consider certain factors, and on August 15th, they might consider other factors? Q. Can you identify --A. There's no way I could explain all of MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. them to you. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 10 10 Q. Is it true, though, that Publix doesn't Q. Does Publix always consider the exact 11 11 pass on the entire cost savings to the customer? same factors when determining how much of a price, 12 12 price savings to pass along to the customer? 13 13 Q. Publix would pass on an amount less than MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. 14 14 A. That's a very broad question again. the total cost, total off allowance? 15 15 A. No, that's not true. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 16 Q. If Publix saved \$100 on a total off Q. You can answer it if you can. 17 17 allowance, would Publix pass on less than \$100 in A. There's no answer to that question. I 18 18 mean, that's an absolute and it's -- there's many savings to the customers? A. No. different factors. I've told you that three 20 20 times. I couldn't explain them all to you. Q. Would Publix pass along exactly \$100 in 21 Q. Sure. I guess what I'm asking is, I savings to the customers? 22 22 A. No. Again, this is a broad question. don't need an explanation of each factor. What 47 49 There's so many different factors involved, I I'm asking is, when Publix, when Publix considers couldn't explain them all to you. whether to pass along a total off allowance to the Q. Sure. Let me ask it a different way. retail customer, by that I mean, reduce the price Is it -- has -- would Publix ever pass on more charged to the retail customer for that product. than the \$100 cost savings to the customer? You've testified that there are many factors that A. Yes. Publix considers when deciding how much of that Q. So there are instances where Publix savings to pass along; is that correct? A. Yes. receives a price discount from the supplier and then gives a larger price discount to the retail Q. And what I'm asking is, does Publix 10 customer for that product? always consider the exact same factors when making 11 11 those decisions? A. There are circumstances. 12 12 Q. Okay. And I assume, is it correct there A. The changing marketplace. 13 13 are circumstances where Publix receives a price Q. Maybe, maybe I'll just ask this: I 14 discount from the supplier and passes along a 14 think you've already testified to this, so i 15 lesser discount to the customer? apologize if we're re-covering the same ground, 16 16 A. Yes. but when Publix considers whether to pass along 17 17 MR. GERMAINE: Objection. the cost savings it realizes from a total cost, 18 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: total off allowance, in terms of how that savings 19 19 Q. And just to be clear, for the Record, gets reflected in the retail price of the shell 20 20 the factors that Publix considers when deciding egg, is it your testimony that the decision Publix 21 how much to pass along to the customer, are great makes, the decision Publix makes about how much of in number? the cost savings to pass on varies depending on

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

14 (Pages 50 to 53)

50 52 the circumstances? shipping? MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. A. No. A. It's a very broad question. All Q. Does Publix receive rebates for decisions vary. grocery -- excuse me. Does Publix's grocery unit BY MR. SCHWINGLER: ever receive rebates from shell egg suppliers for Q. Sometimes Publix passes on a larger purchases of shell eggs? portion of the discount and other times, it passes A. Not that I'm aware of. on a lesser portion of the discount; is that Q. Does Publix ever receive volume accurate? discounts for purchases of shell eggs? 10 10 A. Yes. A. No. 11 11 Q. Okay. Thank you. Turning back to Q. Does Publix ever receive rebates for 12 12 Exhibit 2. Back to the case cost column. Are purchases of liquid retail egg substitute? 13 13 taxes reflected in that column? A. Um, rebates, no, sir. 14 14 MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. Q. Does Publix ever receive volume 15 15 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: discounts for retail liquid egg substitutes? 16 Q. Withdrawn. Earlier, you testified that A. Not that I'm aware of. 17 17 the case cost refers to the price Publix paid for Q. How does the grocery unit -- withdrawn. 18 18 When the grocery unit purchases shell eggs, did a case of that product; is that correct? you testify earlier that the supplier delivers the A. Yes. 20 20 Q. Does the price listed under the case shell eggs directly to the store? 21 21 cost column include taxes? A. Yes. 22 22 MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. Lacks Q. And that's true for all purchases of 51 53 shell eggs? foundation. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: A. Yes. Q. Can you answer the question, Mr. Wilson? Q. And you testified earlier, I believe, A. That's the cost that we paid for the that Publix will purchase retail liquid egg product. substitutes and will receive them from -- through Q. Do you know what -- if the cost you paid 6 a warehouse? for a case of Egg Beaters twin pack was \$22.20, do A. Yes. you know what makes up that \$22.20? Do you know Q. Is that true for all purchases of retail if there's a shipping portion and a tax portion liquid egg substitutes? 10 10 and a product portion, or do you just know the A. Yes. 11 number? 11 Q. So there's never a situation where, for 12 A. That's the number. example, ConAgra would deliver a pallet of Egg 13 13 Q. Okay. If I wanted to find out what all, Beaters directly to a Publix store. 14 you know, what you -- what Publix gets for its 14 A. No. 15 \$22.20, how would I find that out? Q. And -- and again, if I, if I asked you 16 16 MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. this before, I apologize. Do the case costs --17 17 A. We get a case of product. does the case cost column reflect the delivery 18 18 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: charge paid by Publix, if there is one? 19 19 Q. And you write -- you pay \$22.20 to the MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. 20 20 supplier for that product? A. That's the cost we pay for a case of 21 21 A. Yes. product. Q. And you don't pay a separate charge for BY MR. SCHWINGLER:

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

15 (Pages 54 to 57)

54 56 Q. And there's -- and you testified earlier MR. GERMAINE: Let's just ask him if the that there -- that Publix doesn't pay separately meaning of the columns would differ. I assume they won't, but -for shipping, correct? A. Yes. MR. SCHWINGLER: Yeah, yeah. So I will Q. How would one determine which portion of hand -- let's have this as Exhibit 3, please. the case cost is attributable to shipping? (Wilson 3 Received and Marked) MR. GERMAINE: Objection. Asked and BY MR. SCHWINGLER: answered. You can answer again if you can. Q. Mr. Wilson, I've handed you what has A. I've already answered that question. been marked as Exhibit 3. It's a document 10 10 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: bearing, in the bottom right corner, the 11 11 designation native file_[PUB_EGGS_020685]_page 1. Q. Sure. If you could just answer it one 12 12 As with Exhibit 2, I can represent that this more time, please. 13 13 A. That's the cost we pay for a case of document was a PDF created from a page of the 14 14 document, the Excel file produced by Publix as product. 15 15 Q. Sure. My question, though, is, how PUB_EGGS_020685. If you could just review the 16 would you determine what portion of that cost is column headers at the top of the page and then let 17 17 attributable to shipping? me know once you've had a chance. 18 18 A. Yes, sir. A. I can't. 19 Q. And when you say you can't, is it Q. Now, it appears to me the column headers 20 20 because you don't have the knowledge or is it are the same on Exhibit 3 as they were on Exhibit 21 21 because it's not possible to, to break out the 2. Do you agree with that? 22 shipping charge? A. Yes, sir. 55 57 Q. There was one column I forgot to ask MR. GERMAINE: By you, do you mean Publix or him personally? about, which is the right most column that says MR. SCHWINGLER: Let's start with him create and then DTE. Can you explain what create personally. DTE stands for? A. Create date. A. It's not possible. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. And what is the create date? A. I'm assuming that's when the PO was Q. It's not possible. Is that because delivery charge is not -- is that, for example, Q. And how is the -- and the, the received for this product, is it possible that Publix paid 10 a fixed price for the product and so the delivery date was when you got the product, correct? 11 11 A. Yes. charge is, the shipping is just irrelevant? 12 12 MR. GERMAINE: Objection. Q. And the create date would be when you 13 13 A. That's a cost we pay for a case of ordered it? 14 product. 14 A. Yes. 15 15 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Okay. 16 16 A. These are products that we're not Q. Okay. You can set Exhibit 2 aside. 17 17 Actually, you know what? Let's -- if you want to talking about in this deposition. 18 just keep it close by. I have a lot of the same Q. Oh, these products here are --19 19 A. Correct. questions for, you know, sort of the various 20 20 Q. Deviled eggs? transactional data files, so to the extent they are the same columns and the answers wouldn't A. This is not grocery. Q. This is for a different business unit? change, I can try to expedite it.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

16 (Pages 58 to 61)

58 60 A. Yes, sir. But the headings are the MR. SCHWINGLER: This will be Exhibit 4. same. (Wilson 4 Received and Marked) Q. And do you have, do you have any BY MR. SCHWINGLER: knowledge about what those -- whether those Q. Exhibit 4, for the Record, is a one-page headings mean the same thing that they do on print out of the first page of one of the tabs Exhibit 2? produced by Publix at Bates number PUB_EGGS A. I don't have any knowledge of it, but I _020490. I will ask you to review the document would assume they would. They match up. briefly, Mr. Wilson, and let me know once you've Q. My understanding is that this had a chance to --10 10 spreadsheet was labeled warehouse business unit. A. Yes, sir. 11 11 Do you know what the warehouse business unit is? Q. There's a few additional columns on this 12 12 A. No, sir. document from Exhibit 2 that we looked at before. 13 13 Q. Okay. All right. So you're not But just quickly, the column headers that appear 14 14 familiar -- you did not prepare to testify today to be -- at least have the same terminology, do 15 15 about these products listed under the item you see the vendor name column? 16 description column on this page? A. Yes, sir. 17 17 A. No, sir. Q. Does that mean the same thing it did on 18 18 Q. Okay. And you don't have any personal Exhibit 2? 19 knowledge about those products, do you? A. Yes, sir. 20 20 A. I know they're products that we Q. Do you see the date received column? 21 21 purchased, but I don't know. A. Yes, sir. 22 Q. You weren't personally involved in Q. Does that also mean the same thing that 59 61 negotiating the pricing? it did on Exhibit 2? A. Yes, sir. A. No, sir. Q. Okay. We'll set that aside. Q. How about item code? Does that also Can you explain to me what the term DSD mean the same thing that item code meant on exhibit 2? means? A. DSD is -- I'm trying to think what that A. Yes, sir. stands for. I know what it means. It's just --Q. Would any of Publix's transaction data MR. GERMAINE: What does it mean? that has a column titled item code O -- strike A. It's non-warehouse products. that. 10 10 Q. So would that mean like? Can you tell me on the far left corner, 11 A. Distributor, or distributor supplied --11 what the column AP vendor means? 12 MR. GERMAINE: I think it's direct store A. No, sir, I can't. 13 13 delivery. Q. So you don't know what AP vendor means? 14 A. Yes, sir. 14 A. No, sir. 15 15 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Do you know who I could speak to to get 16 16 that information? Q. Apart from the precise name, do you 17 17 understand DSD to mean products that are delivered A. No, sir. directly to Publix stores by the supplier? Q. Do you know what the column buyer vendor 19 19 A. Yes. means? 20 20 Q. And they do not go first to a central A. Yes, sir. 21 warehouse? Q. What is that? A. Correct. A. That's the vendor number assigned to my

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

17 (Pages 62 to 65)

buyer number or to the egg buyer's buyer number. buyer number or to the egg buyer's buyer number. column MR. GERMAINE: I'm sorry, Can you what was that last answer, 203, what it was? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Co. Let me rephrase that question. When you refer to the egg buyer buyer number? A. That's the buyer number what, what is that referring to? A. That's the buyer number what what least shadehead and is ays buyer. Q. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer wendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That sumber labor in the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Os or every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. Os of or every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Standard description. Q. Okay. The column ADJ_final_pack, what does that describe? A. The adjusted final pack. A. The case. A. How any units are in a case? What does the word adjusted signity? A. How many units are in a case? What does the word adjusted signity? A. How many units are in a case? What does the word adjusted signity? A. Wes. C. On you sell me what extended cost means? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is the extended cost means? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is the extended cost means? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the is in the Use of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And the you see the column of the right, and the product of the store. A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. The case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_pudk. A. The case of the product. Q.				
lit's not mine anymore. Q. And what is the egg buyer's buyer number? A. It's been since February. I think it's 203. Q. For a number under the buyer vendor column MR. GERMAINE: I'm sorry. Can you what was that last answer, 203, what it was? MR. SCHWINGLER: BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Let me rephrase that question. When you refer to the egg buyer's buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And whan I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer yendor, how does that mumber relate to the egg buyer's buyer number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number is that rumber relate to the egg buyer's buyer number is the the under number. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And whan I look at the egg buyer's buyer number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number relate to the egg buyer buyer number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number list he vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is many extended cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is the ecost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is many extended cost of a case of the product. A. The adjusted final pack? A. The to case. Q. Oka		62		64
2 O. And what is the egg buyer's buyer number? 3 A. It's been since February. I think it's 5 203. 6 O. For a number under the buyer vendor column 6 MR. GERMAINE: I'm sorry. Can you 6 what was that last answer, 203, what it was? 7 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 8 O. Let me rephrase that question. When you refer to the egg buyer's buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. 9 A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. 9 A. Yes. 9 O. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheat and it says buyer, vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? 9 A. Yes. 9 O. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheat and it says buyer, vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? 9 A. Yes. 9 O. Okay. What does the invoice number always be referring to the same vendor? 9 A. Yes. 9 O. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? 9 A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. 9 O. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? 9 A. Yes. 9 O. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? 9 A. Yes. 9 O. Okay. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? 10 A. Yes. 11 O. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? 12 A. Yes. 13 O. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? 14 A. Yes. 15 O. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? 16 O. Kays. So what would the capital C mean in that column? 17 A. Yes. 18 O. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? 18 A. Yes. 19 O. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? 20 O. Kay So what would the capital C mean in that column? 21 A. Yes. 22 O. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? 23 A. Yes. 24 O. The next column to the right, AD_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? 25 A. Standard description. 26 O. So that's the cost per case of that product.	1	buyer number or to the egg buyer's buyer number.	1	does that describe?
A. It's been since February. I think it's 203. Q. For a number under the buyer vendor column - MR. GERMAINE: I'm sorry. Can you - what was that last answer, 203, what it was? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Let me rephrase that question. When you refer to the egg buyer's buyer number, what, what is that referring to? A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. Q. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheat and it says buyer-vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dellars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 63 A. That assys ADJ_final_quantity? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 65 A. That ta says ADJ_final_quantity? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is the is it adjusted final quantity? Is that what the, um, the column is designating? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. A Case. Q. So that is that describing? A. The case. Q. What do you mean by that? A. How many units were in the case? A. Um, I'm not sure. Q. Not sure? Okay. And what is the ectend the extend the column tast is ealigusted signily? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US delars. G. Okay. And that is is it adjusted final quantity? A. Yes. Q. And what is the view in the extended cost. do you tell me what that means? A. A Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the cap	2	It's not mine anymore.	2	A. The adjusted final pack.
A. It's been since February. I think it's 203. Q. For a number under the buyer vendor column - what was that last answer, 203, what it was? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Let me rephrase that question. When you refer to the egg buyer's buyer number, what, what is that referring to? A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. Q. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Tyes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is you see the column A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 65 Llook at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. A. Case. A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That would be the number of cases received. A. Ayes. A. Yes. A. O. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That would be the number of cases received. A. Ayes. A. Yes. A. Yes. A. Yes. A. Yes. A. Yes. A. Yes.	3	Q. And what is the egg buyer's buyer	3	Q. And what is the adjusted final pack?
203. A How many units were in the case. A How many units were in the case. A How many units are in a case? What does the word adjusted signify? A Un, I'm not sure. A How many units are in a case? What does the word adjusted signify? A Un, I'm not sure. A Un, I'm not sure. A Was. A Yes. A Yes. A Yes. A Yes. A That sub buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. A Yes. A Yes. A That number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. A Yes. A Yes. A Yes. A That number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A Yes. A That number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A Yes. A Yes. A That number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A Yes. A That number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A Yes. A That number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A Yes. A That number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A Yes.	4	number?	4	A. The case.
Q. For a number under the buyer vendor column MR. GERMAINE: I'm sorry. Can you what was that last answer, 203, what it was? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Let me rephrase that question. When you refer to the egg buyer's buyer number, what, what is its that referring to? A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. Q. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that reflers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 63 A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 64 A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that reflers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 65 A. That supplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 65 A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the is is it adjusted final quantity? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number of cases received. Q. And what is the is it adjusted final quantity? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Okay. So what the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. That roots of a case. Q. Okay that is that describing? A. The cost of a case. Q. Okan	5	A. It's been since February. I think it's	5	Q. What do you mean by that?
column MR. GERMAINE: I'm sorry. Can you what was that last answer, 203, what it was? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Let me rephrase that question. When you refer to the egg buyer's buyer number, what, what is is that referring to? A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. A. Yes. Q. O kay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer/vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. Yes. A. That number is the vendor number. A. Yes. Q. O kay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer/vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. Yes. Q. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 63 A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 65 that says ADJ_final_quantity? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 65 that says ADJ_final_quantity? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice that was delivered to the store. The order that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. The column that says standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. C. Okay. And that is the is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 65 that says ADJ_final_quantity? A. Yes. Q. And what is the wendor number is if always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is the wendor number is if always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is the wendor number is if always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what is the vendor number is if always	6	203.	6	A. How many units were in the case.
MR. GERMAINE: I'm sorry. Can you — what was that last answer, 203, what it was? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Let me rephrase that question. When you refer to the egg buyer's buyer number, what, what is that referring to? A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. Q. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And then you see the column A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. Os for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. Oxay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Wes. Q. Oxay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Gase. Q. Can dwhat is that describing? A. The product.	7	Q. For a number under the buyer vendor	7	Q. How many units are in a case? What does
what was that last answer, 203, what it was? BYMR, SCHWINGLER: C. Let me rephrase that question. When you refer to the egg buyer's buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. C. O. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Yes. C. O. Kay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. C. O. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. C. O. Kay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. C. O. Kay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. C. O. Kay. And the you see the column A. That number is the vendor number. C. O. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. C. O. Kay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. C. O. Kay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. C. O. Kay. What does the invoice number store. C. O. Kay. Car you tell me what that means? A. Yes. C. O. Kay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. C. O. Kay. What does the invoice number invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. C. O. Kay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. C. O. Kay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. C. Case. So then the next column to the right, AD_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. C. Case. So then the next column to the right, AD_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. C. Case. So then the next column to the right, AD_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. C. Case. So then the next column to the right, AD_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. C. Case. So then the next column to the right, AD_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. C. Case. So then the next column to the right, AD_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. C. Case. So then the next column to the right, AD_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. That cost of a case. C. So that's the cost of a case	8	column	8	the word adjusted signify?
By MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Let me rephrase that question. When you refer to the egg buyer's buyer number, what, what is that referring to? A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's — the buyer vendor number is — if always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number that store. A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. Oxae. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. That cost of a case of the product. A. That's the buyer rumber is given a number? A. Yes. Q. Oxae. Not all me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Oxae. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. That's the buyer number in number in a the top in the same invoice? A. Yes	9	MR. GERMAINE: I'm sorry. Can you	9	A. Um, I'm not sure.
22 Q. Let me rephrase that question. When you refer to the egg buyer's buyer number, what, what is that referring to? A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. Q. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? A. That column? A. The product. A. The product. A. The product. A. Yes. Q. Os that's the cost per case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what extended cost means? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product. A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Can you tell me what that is is that in US dollars? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product. A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product. A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what	10	what was that last answer, 203, what it was?	10	Q. Not sure? Okay. And what is the
refer to the egg buyer's buyer number, what, what is that referring to? A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. C. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_wendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 653 A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 654 A. That vould be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 655 A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 655 A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 659 A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 650 A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. And what is the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Aljusted final quantity? Is that what the, um, the column is designating? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, AD_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the cost of a case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, AD_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case.	11	BY MR. SCHWINGLER:	11	extend the column that says extended cost, do
lefer to the egy buyer. A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egy buyer. Q. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what extended cost means? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 4 that says ADJ_final_quantity? A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That would be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 4. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That would be the number of cases received. A. That would be the cost of a case of the product. A. That would be the cost of a case of the pr	12	Q. Let me rephrase that question. When you	12	you see that?
A. That's the buyer number assigned to the egg buyer. Q. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? A. That cost of a case of the product. A. That would be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the ost of a case of the product. A. Yes. Q. Can you see the column 4. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that the unique invoice number column to the right, and plant and	13	refer to the egg buyer's buyer number, what, what	13	A. Yes.
egg buyer. Q. So a Publix employee is given a number? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The roduct. A. The roduct. A. The cost of a case of the product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the time you see the column A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the time you see the column A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the number of cases received. Q. And what is the is it adjusted final quantity? Is that what the, um, the column is designating? A. Yes. Q. The next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	14	is that referring to?	14	Q. Can you tell me what extended cost
27 Q. So a Publix employee is given a number? 28 A. Yes. 29 Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? 20 number? 21 A. That number is the vendor number. 22 Q. So that refers only to the vendor. 3 A. Yes. 4 Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? 4 A. Yes. 5 I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? 6 A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. 10 Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? 10 A. Yes. 11 Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? 12 A. Yes. 13 Q. Can you tell me what that means? 14 A. That would be the number of cases received. 15 A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. 16 Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? 17 A. Yes. 18 Q. The column that says standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? 20 Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? 21 A. Standard description. 22 Q. So that's the cost per case of that product. 23 Product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases received. 24 Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? 25 Q. Okay. And that is is that in US dollars? 26 Q. Can, Yes. 27 A. Yes. 28 Q. Can you tell me what that means? 29 Q. The next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? 29 Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? 29 Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? 29 Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	15	A. That's the buyer number assigned to the	15	means?
A. Yes. Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. That column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	16	egg buyer.	16	A. That would be the cost of a case of the
Q. Okay. And when I look at the spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. The order that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The cost of a case. Q. So for every ease of that product.	17	Q. So a Publix employee is given a number?	17	product, multiplied by the, by the number of cases
spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And the you see the column 63 A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The product.	18	A. Yes.	18	received.
that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer number? 63 A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. Yes. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	19	Q. Okay. And when I look at the	19	Q. Okay. And that is is that in US
22 number? 63 A. That number is the vendor number. 2 Q. So that refers only to the vendor. 3 A. Yes. 4 Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if 5 I look at number 1405 in this column, will it 6 always be referring to the same vendor? 7 A. Yes. 8 Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? 9 column represent? 10 A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. The order that was delivered to the store. 13 Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? 16 A. Yes. 17 A. Yes. 18 Q. Dokay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? 18 A. Yes. 19 A. Standard D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? 20 And what is that describing? 21 A. The product. 22 Q. Okay. And the you see the column 22 that says ADJ_final_quantity? 23 A. Yes. 24 A. Yes. 25 A. Yes. 26 Q. Can you tell me what that means? 27 A. Yes. 28 Q. And what is the that means? 29 A. Standard description. 20 Q. And what is that describing? 21 A. The product. 22 Can you tell me what that means? 23 A. The cost of a case. 24 Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? 26 Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? 29 A. The cost of a case. 20 Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	20	spreadsheet and it says buyer_vendor, how does	20	dollars?
A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Case. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the number of cases received. Q. And what is the is it adjusted final quantity? Is that what the, um, the column is designating? A. Yes. Q. The next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The product.	21	that number relate to the egg buyer's buyer	21	A. Yes.
A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Yes. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	22	number?	22	Q. Okay. And the you see the column
A. That number is the vendor number. Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. That's the invoice that was delivered to invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. Yes. Q. And what is the is it adjusted final quantity? Is that what the, um, the column is designating? A. Yes. Q. The next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.				
2 Q. So that refers only to the vendor. 3 A. Yes. 4 Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if 5 I look at number 1405 in this column, will it 6 always be referring to the same vendor? 7 A. Yes. 8 Q. Okay. What does the invoice number 9 column represent? 10 A. That's the invoice that was delivered to 11 the store. The order that was delivered to the store. 12 store. 13 Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? 14 A. Yes. 15 A. Yes. 16 Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? 17 A. Yes. 18 Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. 13 Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. 15 A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.		63		65
Q. So that refers only to the vendor. A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. The order that was delivered to the invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The product. A. Yes. A. Yes. A. That would be the number of cases received. Q. And what is the is it adjusted final quantity? Is that what the, um, the column is designating? A. Yes. Q. The next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. The column that says A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	1	A. That number is the vendor number.	1	that says ADJ final quantity?
A. Yes. Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. The order that was delivered to the store. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Yes. Q. Can you tell me what that means? A. That would be the number of cases received. Q. And what is the is it adjusted final quantity? Is that what the, um, the column is designating? A. Yes. Q. The next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	2		2	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
4 Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if 5 I look at number 1405 in this column, will it 6 always be referring to the same vendor? 7 A. Yes. 8 Q. Okay. What does the invoice number 9 column represent? 10 A. That's the invoice that was delivered to 11 the store. The order that was delivered to the 12 store. 13 Q. So for every entry that has that unique 14 invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? 15 A. Yes. 16 Q. The column that says 17 standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? 18 that means? 19 A. Standard description. 20 Q. And what is that describing? 21 A. The product. 2 A. That would be the number of cases received. 2 Q. And what is the is it adjusted final 4 quantity? Is that what the, um, the column is designating? 2 A. Yes. 2 Q. The next column to the right, A. ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? 4 A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	3	-	3	Q. Can you tell me what that means?
I look at number 1405 in this column, will it always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. The order that was delivered to the invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. So for every entry that has shat unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, A. DJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	4	Q. It's the buyer vendor number is if	4	•
always be referring to the same vendor? A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. A. That's the order that was delivered to the invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. Okay. So othat's the cost per case of that product.	5	·	5	received.
A. Yes. Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. The order that was delivered to the invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The product. A. Yes. Q. Quantity? Is that what the, um, the column is designating? A. Yes. Q. The next column to the right, A. DJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	6	·	6	Q. And what is the is it adjusted final
Q. Okay. What does the invoice number column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. The order that was delivered to the store. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. The column that says A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	7	-	7	•
column represent? A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. The order that was delivered to the store. Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The next column to the right, ADJ_final_UOM, can you tell me what that means? A. Adjusted final unit of measure. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Yes. Q. The column that says in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. Okay. So then the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	8	Q. Okay. What does the invoice number	8	
A. That's the invoice that was delivered to the store. The order that was delivered to the store. 12	9	-	9	
the store. The order that was delivered to the store. 12	10		10	
store. 12 A. Adjusted final unit of measure. 13 Q. So for every entry that has that unique 14 invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? 15 A. Yes. 16 Q. The column that says 17 standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? 18 that means? 19 A. Standard description. 20 Q. And what is that describing? 21 A. Adjusted final unit of measure. 10 Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? 11 A. Case. 12 Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? 18 means? 19 A. The cost of a case. 20 Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	11	the store. The order that was delivered to the	11	
Q. So for every entry that has that unique invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. Okay. So what would the capital C mean in that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	12		12	
invoice number, that's all from the same invoice? A. Yes. Q. The column that says standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The product. In that column? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	13	Q. So for every entry that has that unique	13	-
A. Yes. Q. The column that says that means? A. Case. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. Case. So then the next column to the right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that A. The product.	14		14	
16 Q. The column that says 16 Q. Case. So then the next column to the 17 standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what 18 that means? 19 A. Standard description. 20 Q. And what is that describing? 21 A. The product. 21 Q. Case. So then the next column to the 27 right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that 28 means? 29 A. The cost of a case. 20 Q. So that's the cost per case of that 21 product.	15	·	15	A. Case.
standard_D-E-S-C-R-I-P-T-I, can you tell me what that means? A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The product. right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that means? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	16	Q. The column that says	16	Q. Case. So then the next column to the
that means? 18 means? 19 A. Standard description. 20 Q. And what is that describing? 21 A. The product. 18 means? 19 A. The cost of a case. 20 Q. So that's the cost per case of that 21 product.	17	-	17	right, ADJ_final_cost, can you tell me what that
A. Standard description. Q. And what is that describing? A. The cost of a case. Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	18		18	
Q. And what is that describing? Q. And what is that describing? Q. So that's the cost per case of that product.	19	A. Standard description.	19	
21 A. The product. 21 product.	20	-	20	Q. So that's the cost per case of that
	21	-	21	·
<u> </u>	22	-	22	·

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

18 (Pages 66 to 69)

68 66 Q. And what is the column to the right, eggs that Publix's grocery retail unit purchased ADJ_final_allow? -- I take it, so -- because this spreadsheet has A. Adjusted final allowance. the adjusted final allowance column, this Q. And what would that represent? spreadsheet would reflect when Publix gets a discount for this -- for these products; is that Q. What's TOA? right? A. The total off allowance. A. Yes. Q. These are all zeros on this page. Well, Q. Okay. And then the, furtherest (ph) most column to the right, store_number, can you I may, I may revisit this later, but I think I'll 10 10 tell me what store number refers to? move on to -- all right. We've already covered --11 11 everything that's DSD was delivered directly to A. The location's store number. 12 12 the store and not through a warehouse; is that Q. So, for example, the first entry on this 13 13 spreadsheet was a -- represents two cases of right? 14 14 Eggland's large -- is that a shell egg? A. Yes. 15 15 A. Yes. (Wilson 5 Received and Marked) 16 16 Q. Two cases of Eggland's large shell eggs BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 17 17 that were delivered to store number 273? Q. Mr. Wilson, I'm handing you what's been 18 18 marked as Exhibit 5, which is a print out of one A. Yes. Q. For a total price of \$52.50? page of the Excel spreadsheet produced by Publix 20 20 A. Yes. at Bates number PUB_EGGS_020491. If you could 21 21 Q. Okay. These cost columns have slightly review the column headers at the top of the page 22 different terminology than Exhibit 2, but what I'd and let me know once you've had a chance to do so. 67 69 like to ask you is, are -- would your answers --A. Yes, sir. Q. All right. For the column starting with are your answers the same for this exhibit in terms of the -- whether the cost columns include the column item code, do you see that? delivery charges? A. Yes. sir. A. Yes. Q. Does that column represent the same Q. And so, just to be clear for the Record, information that's in the item code column from the cost column reflects the price paid by Publix Exhibit 4? A. You mean it applies to the standard for that product? A. Yes. description. 10 10 Q. And Publix didn't pay a separate Q. Yeah, yeah. Is the information that 11 11 would be represented in that column, the same type delivery charge? 12 12 of information that was in the item code column in A. No. 13 13 Exhibit 4? Q. And it's not possible to determine how 14 much of the, for example, \$52.50 in the first 14 A. Yes. 15 15 column or the first row, was attributed to Q. Is that also true for the standard 16 16 delivery? description column? 17 17 18 18 Q. Is that also true for the adjusted final Q. And the same is true for taxes, correct? 19 19 MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. pack column? 20 20 A. Yes. A. Yes. 21 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Is that also true for the adjusted final units of measure column? Q. Okay. For the products -- for the shell

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

19 (Pages 70 to 73)

70 72 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: A. Yes. Q. Is that also true for the adjusted final Q. And then this spreadsheet, Exhibit 5, has a column called DSD_INV_NUM. Does that column quantity column? A. Yes. contain the same information as the invoice number Q. And is that also true for the adjusted column from Exhibit 4? final cost Column? A. Yes. A. Yes. Q. And the column to the right of that on Q. So just to be clear for the Record, your Exhibit 5, DSD_INV_DT_REC, what is that? testimony is that the -- these columns that have A. DSD invoice date received. 10 the same description, would provide the same types 10 Q. Does that have -- represent the same 11 of information as those columns in the other -- in 11 information as the date received column from 12 Exhibit 4? Exhibit 4? 13 A. Yes. 13 A. Yes. 14 Q. Okay. On the far right, there's a 14 Q. That's the date on which Publix received 15 column called extended cost. Do you see that? 15 that product at its store, correct? 16 A. Yes. 17 Q. Can you explain what extended cost 17 Q. Okav. 18 MR. SCHWINGLER: Go off the Record for a A. It is the cost of the product multiplied 19 20 times the quantity delivered. 20 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 10:22. We're 21 Q. That would be the total price paid by going off the Record. 22 Publix for that shipment? 22 (Proceedings recessed at 10:22 a.m.) 71 73 A. Yes. (Proceedings resumed at 10:39 a.m.) THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 10:39, we're Q. And there is an extended cost column in Exhibit 4. So would your answers, with respect to back on the Record. the extended cost column for Exhibit 5, be the BY MR. SCHWINGLER: same as Exhibit 4? Q. Mr. Wilson, before we proceed with the A. Yes. questions, during the break, I had a conversation Q. And just to speed things along, if you with counsel for Publix and we discussed ways to don't understand this question or if there's some streamline some of the questions on the confusion, the information I'm looking for is, transaction data. We had previously agreed to I've asked a series of questions related to holding some discussions after this deposition to 11 whether delivery charges and discounts and rebates 11 sort out different information that we may need 12 12 and taxes are reflected in these cost columns. from the transaction data and I think for the mine 13 13 Are your answers the same for Exhibit 5 as they run of, in terms of going through these columns 14 14 were for Exhibits 4 and 2? and categories that we've discussed, we'll pass 15 A. Yes. through the remaining exhibits and sort of revisit 16 16 those in discussions with counsel, if that's MR. SCHWINGLER: Okay. Is there any 17 17 objection? acceptable to Publix. 18 MR. GERMAINE: That's fine. I just -- I MR. GERMAINE: Yeah, it's acceptable to 19 have a question about what you mean by taxes 19 us, Counsel. 20 20 and I've objected to that previously, but I MR. SCHWINGLER: So I have a couple of 21 don't think it's material here. transaction data questions that are sort of MR. SCHWINGLER: Sure. All right. different from those types of issues.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

20 (Pages 74 to 77)

74 76 (Wilson 6 Received and Marked) Q. And then the item cost column, would BY MR. SCHWINGLER: that be the cost of one package of the 30 dozen Q. Mr. Wilson, we've handed you what's been shell eggs that is referenced on this page? marked as Exhibit 6. I'll represent to you that A. I wouldn't think so. this exhibit is an excerpt of a print out of an Q. What would item cost mean to you? excerpt taken from the Excel spreadsheet produced A. I would think that would mean the by Publix at Bates number PUB_EGGS_020483. And package. The 30 dozen. what was excerpted were the columns that you can Q. Sorry. Let me clarify. So the item 9 cost would be the cost of one unit of this see on the first page here for the item code 10 10 13021037 from the dates July 16, 2004, through product, right? 11 11 December 28th, 2007. A. Um, again, I wouldn't think, I wouldn't 12 12 think one unit would cost \$15.60. So we can or, you know, certainly 13 13 confirm later that the information in this exhibit Q. When I mean one unit, I mean a one 14 14 is correct, but for, for purposes of my 30-dozen? 15 15 questioning, I'm representing that this, this is A. Carton. that data. Q. -- carton. 17 17 Could you just review the columns at the A. Yes, sir. 18 18 top of the page and let me know once you've had a Q. Okay. So the item cost column refers to 19 chance to do so? the price paid by Publix for one 30-dozen carton 20 20 A. Yes, sir. of this product. 21 Q. Does the column reference date refer to A. Yes. 22 22 the -- well, does the reference date column refer Q. Okay. And is the Egg Fresh carton white 75 77 large, is that a shell egg product? to the invoice date or the date the product was received by Publix? A. Again, I've never seen this item code A. I don't know. before. I'm -- I, I would assume it is a shell Q. Don't know. The item code is, is that egg. the same as you testified earlier, about what the Q. Okay. term item code means? A. This item code doesn't match up with A. It doesn't look like it, no. I've never anything in our system, so -seen that item code before. MR. GERMAINE: Counsel, have we Q. You've never seen item code 13021037? identified this to you in some way or 10 A. No, sir. described this file to you as associated with 11 Q. Under the column description, do you 11 the business unit, do you know? 12 12 know what that means? MR. SCHWINGLER: Let me see. 13 13 A. Yes, sir. MR. GERMAINE: I have an idea I know 14 Q. And what is that? 14 what it is, but maybe we can work it out 15 15 A. The description of the product. later if we need to, but --16 16 Q. Okay. So this, this product is Egg MR. SCHWINGLER: I have a feeling --17 17 Fresh cartoned white large 30 dozen; is that yeah, this does come from the manufacturing 18 18 correct? Is that what the DZ means? business unit, so maybe this is for 19 19 A. Yes, sir. tomorrow's witness. 20 20 Q. And under the vendor name, the vendor is MR. GERMAINE: It could be. I suspect 21 21 Cal-Maine; is that correct? it relates to some Morning Song business. MR. SCHWINGLER: Yeah. A. Yes, sir.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

21 (Pages 78 to 81)

78 80 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Okay. I'm going to ask you for -- can Q. Can you explain -- are you familiar with you go to the -- received date, does that mean the date that Publix received this product in its Morning Song? MR. GERMAINE: That's -warehouse? A. No, sir. A. I'm not sure. Q. You're not familiar with Morning Song? Q. Earlier, with respect to Exhibit 2, A. No, sir. you're free to look at Exhibit 2, you testified Q. Morning Song would be for tomorrow's that received date refers to the date that Publix witness. So you're not -- you are not familiar received the product at issue. Do you recall 10 10 with item code 1021037? that? 11 11 A. No, sir. A. Yes. 12 12 MR. SCHWINGLER: This is Exhibit 6? Q. Do you have any reason to believe that 13 13 THE COURT REPORTER: That was, yes. the received date in this other spreadsheet would 14 14 be anything other than the date on which Publix MR. SCHWINGLER: Let me -- I'm going to 15 15 set this aside for now. Mark this as the received the product? 16 next exhibit in order, please. A. There's no PO numbers on this report, 17 17 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: either, so --18 18 Q. Mr. Wilson, we've handed you what's been Q. Sure. It is a partial excerpt of just 19 19 marked as Exhibit 7. Would you please review the certain columns. 20 20 A. There's no quantities or anything else. column headings at the top of the page? 21 21 (Wilson 7 Received and Marked) You can assume that. 22 22 A. Yes, sir. Q. Sure. Turning to the entry, the first 79 81 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: entry on the first page for July 16th, 2004, under Q. So Exhibit 7, I'll represent to you, is the received date column. Do you see that? another excerpt. This one is taken from the Excel spreadsheet produced by Publix at PUB_EGGS_020502. Q. The case cost column, does that refer to And it's an excerpt of all entries for the item the cost that Publix paid for one case of this product? code 853987 from July 16th, 2004 until December 28th, 2007. And it includes the columns that are A. Yes. Q. So on July 16th, 2004, for the, for the visible on the page. Are you familiar with item code 853987? shipment referred to under the received date of 10 A. Yes. July 16th, 2004, Publix paid \$24.36 for a case of 11 Q. What product is associated with that 11 this product; is that correct? 12 item code? A. Yes. 13 13 A. Egg Beaters pint. Q. And if you can take a minute to look 14 Q. And Egg Beaters is a product produced by 14 through, the document has just over 22 pages. And 15 ConAgra; is that correct? 15 I -- if you just want to review the case cost 16 16 A. Yes. column on those 22 pages and let me know once 17 17 Q. And that's a retail liquid egg you've had a chance to do so. substitute, correct? A. Yes, sir. 19 19 A. Yes. Q. Is it true that the case cost for every 20 20 Q. And this particular product is a entry in this exhibit was \$24.36? 21 21 16-ounce product; is that correct? A. Yes. 22 A. Yes. MR. GERMAINE: Object to the form of the

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

22 (Pages 82 to 85)

82 84 question. December 27th, 2008? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. Q. You've had a chance to review this A. Assuming all the information in this entire document; is that correct? Have you had a document reflects the cost of the product, yes. chance to review the case cost column for this BY MR. SCHWINGLER: entire document; is that correct? Q. So we're not -- I mean, the data speaks A. Yes, sir. for itself. The document speaks for itself. Q. Would you agree that the number We're not trying to play any games. What -- I'm 9 reflected in the case cost column is the same for trying to understand what that means. 10 10 every, every entry on this exhibit? So that does mean for a period of 11 11 MR. GERMAINE: Object to the form of the several years, every time Publix bought this 12 12 question. This is a date the excerpt was specific product, it paid the same price for a 13 13 prepared by opposing counsel for purposes of case? Assuming this information is correct? 14 A. Yes. the deposition, which has been edited in some 15 way or another, so the authenticity of this 15 Q. Okay. Do you happen to know whether 16 16 document is in question. But to the extent this product was purchased on a fixed price 17 17 contract? you want the witness to read or interpret 18 18 your own editing of this document, you can A. No. sir. 19 ask him that. But as for any other Q. Do you know who I could speak to to get 20 20 that information? conclusions, I object. 21 21 A. The columns match. A. No, sir. 22 22 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Who is in charge of negotiating with 83 85 ConAgra about the Egg Beaters product and the Q. So every column has the number \$24.36? A. Yes. price that Publix paid for it from 2002 until Q. So assuming that this excerpt is December 31st of 2008? accurate and correctly reflects the prices that A. The buyer that was in charge of it at Publix paid for this product on these dates, or that time. for shipments corresponding to these dates, would Q. Yeah, who was the buyer that was in you agree that the price for the Egg Beaters pint charge of this product? paid by Publix did not change between July 16th, A. Bessie Foster. 9 2004 and December 27th, 2008? Q. Bessie Foster. Was she in charge of 10 10 MR. GERMAINE: Objection. this product for the entire period from 2002 to 11 A. Are you saying according to this 11 2008? 12 12 document? Is that what you're asking? According A. I took over in 2007. 13 13 to this document? Q. To the best your knowledge, prior to --14 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 14 to when you took over from Ms. Foster, was Ms. 15 15 Q. Yeah. Assuming this document accurately Foster the buyer in charge of this Egg Beaters 16 16 product on Exhibit 7 in 2002 until you took over? reflects the transaction data produced by Publix 17 17 and that none of the numbers are different -- we A. Yes. 18 didn't change it around -- assuming that it's an Q. You can set that aside. 19 19 accurate excerpt from Publix's transaction data, A. Yes, sir. 20 20 the question is, isn't it true that the price Q. Mr. Wilson, how does Publix's grocery 21 21 Publix paid for this product, Egg Beaters pint 16 business unit, just in a general sense, how does ounce, remained the same from July 16th, 2004 to the Publix grocery unit choose its suppliers?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

23 (Pages 86 to 89)

88 86 A. In a general sense. Can you -gifts from vendors. Q. Does Publix have a, a standard procedure A. Yes, sir. for choosing suppliers across all product lines? Q. Does Publix have a policy like that? A. Well, you mean as far as reviewing A. Yes. suppliers? Q. And that policy would apply to egg Q. I guess what I -- let me see if I can buyers, just like it would apply to cereal buyers; rephrase. Publix sells a wide variety of is that correct? A. Yes. products; is that correct? A. Yes. Q. That's, that's what I'm aiming at. Are 10 10 Q. And it obtains those products from a there any other policies that apply to all buyers 11 11 wide variety of suppliers, correct? that limit or govern how they would choose their 12 12 A. Yes. suppliers. 13 13 Q. And there are different -- you've A. We cannot choose a supplier from gifts, 14 14 testified that different people have if that's what you're asking. 15 15 responsibility for different products; is that Q. That is one thing I'm asking. But are 16 16 correct? there any other similar policies that govern how a 17 A. Yes. 17 supplier can be chosen? 18 18 A. You have to have good business Q. So there's not one buyer buying every product that goes into Publix stores. practices. 20 20 A. No. Q. Do suppliers have to be approved through 21 21 Q. My question is, given the wide range of some central administrative office or does -- is 22 products that Publix sells and the wide range of the buyer allowed to choose the supplier? 87 89 A. Yes. They do have to be approved products that Publix needs to buy, does Publix have a central policy that governs how it chooses through other business units. suppliers for various products? Q. So you had -- I think you testified A. Central policy? Like a mandate? earlier that within the grocery retail unit, you Q. Yes. have a buyer and then you have the D --A. No. sir. MR. GERMAINE: BDD. Q. So the way, the way egg suppliers are BY MR. SCHWINGLER: chosen, for example, could have a different Q. BDD, the business -procedure entirely than the way cereal is, cereal A. Development director. 10 suppliers are chosen? Q. -- development director and that the 11 11 A. It would be similar. business development director supervises the 12 12 MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. buyer; is that correct? 13 13 A. It would be similar. It would still be A. He supervises the category manager. 14 a Publix realm, but it would have to be different 14 Q. Who then supervise the buyer? 15 15 because they are providing different products. A. Yes, sir. 16 16 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. So with respect to eggs, who among those 17 17 Q. Does Publix have guidelines that limit three, buyer, category manager, business 18 18 what its buyers can do when choosing suppliers? development director, who has the final say in 19 19 A. Limits what its buyers can do when which egg suppliers to use? 20 20 choosing suppliers? A. Final say would be the business 21 21 Q. Let me just give you an example. Some development director. companies have a policy that says you can't accept Q. And --

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

24 (Pages 90 to 93)

90 92 A. A lot of -supplier? Q. What role -- please finish. A. Along with other people in Publix. I Q. That would be part of the process that Publix undertakes when deciding which suppliers to mean, it's not just one person's decision. Q. So the business development director would need to get approval from others outside of A. Yes. Q. Okay. How often does the grocery unit that product line? MR. GERMAINE: Objection. evaluate which egg suppliers to use? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: A. Not very often. 10 10 Q. Who would the business development Q. Does Publix have a policy that every X 11 11 director consult with when deciding which supplier months or years, you have to review a supplier to 12 12 to use? reevaluate whether to continue using them? 13 13 A. MSP. A. No, sir. 14 14 Q. And I forgot what you had said that was. Q. So what would cause Publix to reevaluate 15 A. CQA. 15 whether to continue using a certain shell egg 16 Q. CQA is the quality control? 17 17 A. Yes, sir. A. Many different factors. 18 18 Q. Can you -- would quality be a factor? Q. MSP was what? A. They're -- they, they're in charge of A. Yes. 20 20 the Publix procurement side of it for private Q. Reliability? 21 21 label products. A. Yes. 22 Q. Does MSP have a set of standards for Q. Would these answers be the same for egg 91 93 suppliers that it requires Publix or the suppliers product suppliers? to meet before Publix will hire them? A. Yes. A. Yes. Q. Including or not, would it be the same Q. Are those standards written? for retail liquid egg substitute suppliers? A. Yes. A. Yes, sir. Q. And do they apply to all products across Q. So there's not a, sort of a formal the company? structure for reviewing them, but from time to A. Yes, sir. time, Publix will review whether to change its Q. And does CQA have a set of standards -shell egg suppliers? 10 withdrawn. A. Yes. 11 Is it correct that CQA has standards for 11 Q. Okay. And the same is true for its 12 12 specific egg products or shell eggs that a suppliers of retail liquid egg substitutes. 13 13 A. Yes. supplier must meet before Publix will buy from 14 that supplier? 14 Q. Okay. Does Publix sell, like, pre-made 15 15 A. I'm sure they do. omelet mix or things like that? 16 Q. Is there an auditing requirement? A. Egg Beaters has products in their liquid 17 17 A. Yes, there is. eggs. 18 Q. For safety requirements? Q. They have an omelet type of product. 19 19 A. Yes. That's a vague question, I understand. How do you 20 20 Q. And does CQA get involved? Does CQA describe sort of the range of products -- but 21 confirm that a supplier meets those requirements there -- you can go into a Publix grocery store before Publix commits to buying eggs from that and buy a product that allows you to sort of open

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

25 (Pages 94 to 97)

94 96 the package, put it in the pan and you've got an A. They provided the product at a cost and we paid for it. Q. And how did the -- how was the cost MR. GERMAINE: Objection. A. There's, like, there's products in determined? there, liquid eggs. A. They told us what they were charging for BY MR. SCHWINGLER: the product. Q. Okay. I mentioned earlier the idea of a Q. And when you say they, you're referring pricing structure, which I defined as a, sort of a to the supplier -mechanism for determining the price. An example A. Yes. 10 10 being a discount off of Urner Barry market price Q. -- of the branded shell egg? 11 11 for a fixed price or a price that varies based on A. Yes. 12 12 Q. For example, Eggland's Best. grain. 13 13 And as to shell eggs, between 2002 and 14 14 January 31st, 2008, did Publix ever purchase shell Q. How often would Publix and the supplier 15 eggs on any basis other than the Urner Barry 15 negotiate the cost of one of these fixed cost 16 16 market price? transactions? 17 17 A. Private label Publix brand eggs, no. MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. 18 18 Q. What about branded shell eggs? A. When they, when they adjusted the price. 19 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 20 20 Q. How often? Q. And could you explain to me how Publix 21 21 -- on what basis Publix purchased branded shell A. The cost --22 eggs? Q. How often would the supplier adjust the 97 95 A. Fixed cost. Q. What do you mean by fixed cost? A. It was up to them. There was no set time frame as far as we were concerned. A. Cost per case. Q. And is that the cost of the supplier's Q. So I'd just like to walk through one of these transactions for a branded shell egg that cost? A. That's how much we paid for the product. Publix purchased on what you described as a Q. So you paid a fixed price per case? fixed-cost basis. Does -- just starting from point one, how is the process initiated? Does A. Fixed cost. Q. So can you explain to me what you mean Publix place an order? by the term cost? A. You mean before we carry it? Before 11 11 A. How much we paid for the product. it's in our stores? 12 12 Q. How much Publix paid. So when you say Q. Sure. Let's go back to before it's in 13 13 we had a fixed cost contract, what you're saying your stores. 14 is --14 A. They would present the item to us and --15 15 MR. GERMAINE: He didn't say contract. ask for an appointment; present the item to us. 16 16 Try to sell their product to us, obviously. They A. I didn't say contract. 17 17 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: are sales people. And then we make a 18 Q. Oh, he didn't say contract? determination whether or not we wanted to buy the 19 19 product and place it in our stores. A. No, sir. 20 20 Q. So what fixed -- how is the, the price Q. Okay. So Publix has now decided to buy 21 21 Publix paid fixed? Under a fixed cost the product and it's being offered on a fixed-cost basis. Does Publix then order a quantity of the arrangement?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

26 (Pages 98 to 101)

	98		100
1		1	
2	product?	2	system that orders the products for the stores of
3	A. It's delivered straight to the store	3	of supply and demand.
4	from the DSD supplier.	4	Q. Okay. So there's one order or a central
5	Q. Based on the quantity that Publix	5	order going to the supplier from Publix. And then
6	ordered, correct?	6	the supplier has to send the eggs to the
7	A. For each store.	7	individual stores that are part included in the
8	Q. For each store. Who has	8	order. A. Yes.
9	A. We don't make a, we don't make a	9	7 100.
10	truckload order.	10	Q. Okay. When that order goes out, how is
11	Q. Does each store have a purchaser that	11	the price for that order, for that order
12	determines the quantity that they will be getting?	12	determined?
13	MR. GERMAINE: Objection.		A. For branded eggs?
	A. A person?	13 14	Q. Yeah. For Eggland's Best?
14	BY MR. SCHWINGLER:		A. The cost that they supplied us.
15	Q. Let's say you've got 50 stores and you	15	Q. So they've already told you what the
16	want to buy Eggland's Best for the 50 stores.	16	price would be in advance.
17	Does each of the 50 stores have a buyer that	17	A. It's a fixed cost.
18	places an order for a certain quantity of	18	Q. And but so, before the order goes
19	Eggland's Best or does it come through some, some	19	out, Publix knows what that the cost will be
20	other centralized process?	20	for each unit.
21	MR. GERMAINE: Objection.	21	A. For the branded eggs.
22	A. An order is placed for the product	22	Q. Is that, is that correct?
	99		101
1	through the stores.	1	A. Yes.
2	BY MR. SCHWINGLER:	2	Q. When is that cost communicated to
3	Q. Who places the order?	3	Publix?
4	A. From 2002 to 2008, is that the time	4	A. As before, when they brought the product
5	frame you're talking about?	5	in to show us.
6	Q. Sure. Yeah.	6	Q. So the first time they sell you the
7	A. Um	7	product, that's when they tell you what the fixed
8	MR. GERMAINE: You're talking about the	8	cost will be?
9	literal function of placing the order?	9	A. Yes.
10	MR. SCHWINGLER: Yeah. I'm trying to	10	Q. And then does that ever change? Does
11	understand the mechanics of how	11	the cost ever change?
12	A. How the product gets to the	12	A. Um, it could.
13	BY MR. SCHWINGLER:	13	Q. And when, when how does the cost
14	Q. How the product gets to the, to the	14	explain to me how the, how the supplier and Publix
15	stores and who's making the decisions along the	15	would change the cost.
16	lines. So who orders the Eggland's Best eggs,	16	A. If they bring a cost increase or a
17	let's say 2003 time frame?	17	decrease to us.
18	A. A computer program.	18	Q. So they would communicate the
19	Q. And is that computer program, does each	19	supplier would communicate to Publix that the
20	individual store have its own computer that makes	20	price is going up or down?
21	its own order?	21	A. Yes.
22	A. There's a central, there's a central	22	Q. And they would tell you what the new

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

27 (Pages 102 to 105)

102	104
¹ price is?	¹ Q. Yeah.
² A. The new cost to us, yes.	A. I didn't mention a contract, no, sir.
³ Q. Yes. The price that Publix paid to the	³ Q. I thought I heard you testify, and I
4 supplier for that product.	4 could be mistaken, that there is not a contract.
⁵ A. Yes.	5 A. I never mentioned a contract.
⁶ Q. Okay. And then that would be the price	⁶ Q. Okay. Is there is there a does
until you heard from them another time about a	Publix enter into contracts for the purchase of
⁸ price change.	8 branded shell eggs?
⁹ A. Yes.	⁹ A. No, sir.
¹⁰ Q. Okay. Did Publix ever push back on the	Q. Just to sort of close the loop on this,
price being charged for Eggland's Best?	you testified, I think earlier, that Publix
A. For branded eggs in general, yes.	currently purchases its own branded shell eggs
Q. So you didn't have to necessarily accept	13 from two suppliers.
the cost that the supplier imposed. There was	¹⁴ A. Yes.
some negotiation, correct?	¹⁵ Q. That was Cal-Maine and Country Charm?
A. We can always delete an item if we chose	¹⁶ A. Yes.
to. There's always yes.	Q. From 2002 to the end of 2008, did Publix
¹⁸ Q. So they weren't free to charge whatever	purchase shell eggs for its own brand from any
19 they wanted.	19 other suppliers?
MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form.	²⁰ A. Yes.
²¹ BY MR. SCHWINGLER:	²¹ Q. Can you give me some examples?
Q. So the suppliers of the branded shell	²² A. Tampa Farms.
103 eggs were not free to charge Publix whatever they	105 ¹ Q. Tampa Farms. And when did
wanted, because Publix didn't have to buy from	² approximately what timeline, time frame did
3 them, correct?	³ Publix during which time frame did Publix buy
MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form.	shell eggs from Tampa Farms?
5 A. If we wanted the product, we had to pay	5 A. Which time frame? Um, 2002 until Tampa
6 what they asked.	Farms sold to Cal-Maine.
BT WIN. SOLIWINGLEN.	Q. Phor to that end point in time, did
Q. You were free to decline the product at	T ublix purchase shell eggs from Cal-Maine:
the price offered, correct?	A. Prior to that?
WIN. OLINWAINE. Objection to form.	Q. Belore rampa ramis was solu to
A. We had to purchase the product at the cost that they offered us if we wanted the	Cal-Maine, did had Publix already been purchasing eggs from Cal-Maine at that time?
product.	13 A. Yes.
14 BY MR. SCHWINGLER:	Q. Is that the same true for Country Charm?
DI WIK. SCHWINGLER. 15 Q. If you wanted it. And if you didn't	¹⁵ A. Yes.
want the product, then you wouldn't buy it,	Q. Apart from when Tampa Farms was sold to
the product, then you wouldn't buy it,	¹⁷ Cal-Maine, did Publix have any other significant
¹⁸ A. Correct.	thanges in shell egg suppliers between 2002 and
Q. Were there all right. But I think	the end of 2008?
20 you said before, there was no contract governing	²⁰ MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form.
these transactions, right?	A. I'm not sure.
²² A. For branded eggs?	22 BY MR. SCHWINGLER:

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

28 (Pages 106 to 109)

106 108 Q. When I say significant, I would mean --A. Yes, sir. I would refer to a supplier that sells a large Q. You did. If you could turn to page 5. And I'll direct you to the -- halfway through the volume of shell eggs to Publix. For example, Cal-Maine and Country Charm. Were there any shell first paragraph. There's a passage that says: egg suppliers that sold a comparable volume of "Similarly, for plaintiff's grocery business unit, shell eggs to Publix between 2002 and the end of the prices of the Publix brand eggs and egg 2008 that Publix no longer buys from? products this business unit purchased from A. Hillendale Farms provided Publix with Defendants and other suppliers over the relevant eggs and they sold out to Cal-Maine also. period, were determined by a negotiated discount 10 10 Q. And did Publix continue to buy from off of the prevailing Urner Barry price quotation 11 11 Hillendale up to the point -for the subject product and region. The discount 12 12 A. That they sold -was arrived at through Publix's category review 13 13 Q. -- that they sold to Cal-Maine? process." 14 14 A. Yes. Do you see that? 15 15 Q. They did. Were there any other, apart A. Yes. 16 from Tampa Farms, Hillendale, Cal-Maine and Q. Can you explain to me what Publix's 17 17 Country Charm, any other major suppliers of shell category review process refers to? 18 18 eggs to Publix between 2002 and the end of 2008? A. That's where MSP goes out to find the 19 A. No, sir. suppliers we talked about. 20 20 MR. SCHWINGLER: What exhibit are we on? Q. And can you, just in a little bit more 21 THE COURT REPORTER: 8. detail, how often does Publix have a category 22 22 (Wilson 8 Received and Marked) review process? 107 109 A. We talked about it earlier. There's no BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Mr. Wilson, I've handed you what's been set time frame. marked as Exhibit 8. If you would -- want to just Q. I'm sorry, I didn't catch the last -take a moment to briefly review the document, I A. There's no set time line. Q. What would lead Publix to hold a will, will direct you to more specific locations. But if you just want to take a look at it and category review? familiarize yourself with it generally. Let me A. As earlier, product supply and quality. know when you've had a chance to do so. Q. Just generally speaking, can you describe how the category review process works? A. Yes, sir. 10 10 Q. Mr. Wilson, do you recognize this A. Um, MSP sends out a questionnaire. 11 document? 11 Q. And who does MSP send the questionnaire 12 12 A. Yes, sir. to? 13 13 Q. And is this document Publix's A. Suppliers. 14 Supplemental Objections and Answers to Defendant's 14 Q. Suppliers. Does MSP send a 15 15 First Set of Interrogatories? questionnaire to current suppliers or which -- how 16 16 A. Yes, sir. does MSP determine which suppliers to send the 17 17 Q. Did you participate in the preparation questionnaire to? of Publix's supplemental objections and answers? A. The suppliers come to us. 19 19 A. We relied on our counsel. Q. How do they -- how would the -- does 20 20 Q. Sure, but did you provide information Publix publish that it will be holding a category 21 regarding the subject matter of these review? interrogatories that were used in these answers? A. The suppliers do a registration of

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

29 (Pages 110 to 113)

110 112 interest all the information, relevant information from Q. What's a registration of interest? A. A registration that they are interested Q. Okay. And at what point -- is the in being a supplier. decision then just made based on further Q. Is it something that Publix requires for evaluation or are there other, um -- withdrawn. Does Publix send requests for more all egg suppliers? A. No. The suppliers do this to be a information to those suppliers at that point? supplier for Publix potentially. A. Um, that's an MSP process, so -- I'm not Q. So that's the way a supplier sure if they -- I don't know. 10 10 communicates to Publix that it's interested in Q. Okay. Ultimately, I'll probably circle 11 11 selling eggs to Publix. back to this category review process later when 12 12 A. Yes. I've got the benefit of some documents, but is 13 13 Q. So the first step in the category review there eventually an auction held to determine who 14 14 is that MSP sends out a -- what does MSP send to wins the business? 15 15 the suppliers to initiate this process? A. On eggs, I don't believe so. 16 A. A questionnaire. Q. Okay. If you want to turn to, let's 17 17 see. Page 7. The first full paragraph, there's a Q. A questionnaire. What, generally, would 18 18 sentence starting with "however". It says: the questionnaire ask? 19 19 A. Questions about their business However, Plaintiff's grocery business unit 20 20 practices. purchased national brand eggs and egg products and 21 Q. And then I assume the suppliers would specialty eggs based on a fixed vendor price 22 list." then respond to the questionnaire if they were 111 113 Do you see that? interested in the business? A. Yes. A. Yes. Q. What's the next step in the category Q. And can you explain to me what a fixed review process once the responses come in from the vendor price list is? suppliers? A. The fixed cost. A. Um, MSP looks at the different suppliers Q. So is this -- this is referring to what to see if they are truly capable of becoming you testified to earlier about the suppliers or not. fixed-cost-based purchases? 9 Q. Does MSP then whittle down the list or A. Yes. 10 10 choose suppliers based on the responses for Q. And so, these are, these are 11 further evaluation? 11 transactions that are not tied to the Urner Barry 12 A. Yes. price for eggs, correct? 13 13 Q. And can you explain then the next step A. Yes. 14 in that process? 14 Q. And when you say national brand eggs, 15 A. You just did. are you referring to Eggland's Best? 16 16 (Laughter) A. That would be one. 17 17 Q. So MSP, MSP, based on the response, Q. Are there any other national brand eggs 18 determines a group of suppliers that advance to that you're aware of that would be purchased in 19 19 the next round? this way? 20 20 A. Yes. A. Davidson's. 21 Q. And what is the next round? Q. Davidson's? What does Davidson's sell A. Um, MSP continues evaluating them; gets or what -- is it a, a shell egg?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

30 (Pages 114 to 117)

114 116 A. Yes. Q. Was that true for all private label Q. Is it organic? liquid eggs that Publix purchased from 2002 to the end of 2008? A. No. Q. Anything, any other national brand eggs A. For the grocery unit, yes. other than Eggland's Best and Davidson's? Q. And is that still true today? A. Country Hen. A. Yes. Q. Country Hen. Any others? Q. And the response here on page 7 refers A. I guess you could count Four Grain as a to specialty eggs. Can you describe what you mean national brand. by specialty eggs? 10 Q. What is Four Grain? Is that a --A. Eggland's best. You said it earlier 11 11 A. It's a branded egg. when you said Four Grain. 12 12 Q. Is it a -- is it considered a specialty Q. Four Grain. So these are shell eggs 13 13 egg? that have different characteristics than a 14 14 A. Yes. conventional shell egg? 15 15 Q. Would you agree that ConAgra Egg Beater MR. GERMAINE: Objection. 16 products were sold to Publix based on a fixed A. Um, different characteristics. 17 17 vendor price list? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 18 A. Yes. 18 Q. What makes Eggland's Best a specialty 19 19 Q. What about, when Publix purchased the 20 20 A. The claims that the manufacturer --Publix brand retail liquid egg substitutes -- can 21 21 I just call it private label liquid? Do you 22 22 Q. And those claims -- what do those claims understand what I mean by that? 115 117 A. Yes. relate to? Q. So when Publix purchased private label A. Cholesterol. Heart health. liquid, by which I mean the Publix branded retail Q. Okay. You can set 8 aside, although I'd liquid egg substitutes, did Publix purchase those keep it close by. I may be returning back to it. I'm sorry, please -- keep it and stay on page 7. eggs on a market basis? 6 A. Yes. You testified earlier that Publix Q. Can you just describe what an example of purchased sort of national brand retail liquid egg trans-- would it be a -- would Publix purchase its substitutes like Egg Beaters; is that correct? private label liquid on a discount off of the A. Yes, sir. 10 10 **Urner Barry market?** Q. And is it correct that Publix did not 11 A. No. 11 purchase those products off of the Urner Barry 12 12 Q. No. How would the price be determined market? 13 13 that Publix paid to the supplier for the private A. Correct. 14 label liquid? 14 Q. The branded -- the national brand retail 15 15 A. There was a Urner Barry liquid price a liquid egg substitutes were purchased off of a 16 16 monthly average, basically, with an upcharge for fixed vendor price list; is that correct? 17 17 them to produce it. A. Yes. 18 Q. So the price would vary from month to Q. All right. So just so my understanding 19 19 month? is correct, you're not familiar with Morning Song 20 20 A. Yes. eggs, are you? 21 21 Q. Based on the average Urner Barry index? A. No, sir. A. Yes. Q. Or Morning Song? And you're not --

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

31 (Pages 118 to 121)

118 120 A. No. sir. are UEP certified. Q. -- prepared to testify about Morning Q. So when -- so let me put it another way. Song, correct? Does Publix require UEP certification before it A. No, sir. will consider a bid from an egg supplier? Q. Turning back to shell egg purchases more A. Um, no, sir. generally, I understand, and we've got to be Q. Would your answers be the same for clear, that you have the Publix branded eggs that Publix branded private label liquid? you purchased off of the Urner Barry market, A. In terms of the competitive bidding correct? process? 10 10 A. Yes. Q. Let me withdraw the question. Does 11 11 Q. And then you have some of the national Publix have a category review process for private 12 12 branded shell eggs that you purchased off of a label liquid? 13 13 fixed vendor price list --A. Yes. 14 14 A. Yes. Q. And as part of that category review 15 15 Q. -- correct? For the Publix branded process, does Publix solicit bids from suppliers 16 shell eggs, did Publix have a competitive bidding of private label liquid? 17 17 system to determine which suppliers to use and how A. Yes. 18 18 much to pay? Q. And does Publix determine which 19 A. MSP, whenever they submitted their cost suppliers to include in that process using the 20 20 to us. written questionnaire responses that it received 21 21 Q. When you say MSP, whenever they as a result of the, the MSP sending out the 22 22 submitted their cost to us, can you explain what questionnaire? 119 121 you mean? A. Yes, we use the questionnaire. A. Whenever they did the supplier review. Q. Okay. So the process for choosing the Q. MSP would hold a supplier review and as Publix branded shell egg suppliers and the Publix part of that review, MSP would solicit bids for branded private label liquid suppliers is different products; is that correct? generally the same in terms of you send out a A. You're talking about for eggs, right? questionnaire, you get the response, then you Q. Sure. Yep. solicit bids from the suppliers that you like. 8 A. Yes, sir. A. Yes. 9 Q. So we've already covered how Publix MR. GERMAINE: Objection. 10 decides which suppliers to solicit bids from. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 11 11 That's the first step of the category review; is Q. From the -- let me rephrase. Once 12 12 that right? you've gotten the written responses from the 13 13 A. Yes, sir. questionnaire for PL, private label liquid, Publix 14 14 Q. With the written questionnaire? Does determines which suppliers to then contact for a 15 15 Publix -- are you familiar with the term UEP bid; is that correct? 16 certified? A. Yes. 17 17 A. Yes. Q. Okay. 18 18 MR. SCHWINGLER: Is this 9? Q. Does Publix only solicit bids for shell 19 19 eggs from UEP certified companies? THE COURT REPORTER: Mm-hmm. 20 20 A. By default, yes. (Wilson 9 Received and Marked) 21 Q. What do you mean by, by default? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: A. Ninety-seven percent of the companies Q. Mr. Wilson, I've handed you what's been

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

32 (Pages 122 to 125)

122 124 marked as Exhibit 9, which is a document bearing A. He worked in MSP. the Bates range PUB_EGGS_006998 through 007024. Q. He did. Was he responsible for eggs, You're free to review as much of the document as shell eggs? Shell egg -- was Steve Hicks involved you need to. I will direct you to some specific in the decision to purchase shell eggs from pages so, so I may direct your attention to, to different suppliers? A. Um, if he sent out this document from the page bearing the Bates number 007005. And at MSP, then he was in -- he was the one in charge of the top of the page, it says "Publix brand eggs the category review for shell eggs. vendor requirements". Do you see that? Q. For shell eggs. Okay. So what my A. Yes. 10 10 Q. Are you familiar with this document? understanding of this e-mail is that whoever 11 11 received this e-mail, presumably a supplier or a A. It's the first time I've seen it. 12 set of suppliers, they've returned some sort of Q. Are you familiar -- have you seen 13 13 written questionnaire and now they are being documents that, you know, generally look like 14 14 invited to submit quotations. Would this be an 15 15 example of sort of that, the next phase of MR. GERMAINE: Are you talking about the 16 16 soliciting competitive bids that you discussed whole document or just the one page? 17 earlier? 17 MR. SCHWINGLER: Well, I guess we're a 18 A. Um, I would assume. little unclear, based on the way it was 19 Q. Okay. So if you turn two pages to the produced, sort of whether there's multiple 20 page bearing the Bates range 007004. It's titled 20 pages to this document. Let me see if I can 21 "Publix Brand Category Review" and then has the get some --22 words "Eggs" underneath. Do you see that? 22 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 123 125 Q. So if you flip back to the page A. Yes. beginning with 007002. Q. And then it says "Auction and Activity A. Okay. Schedule". Do you see that? Q. Okay. And this is what appears to be an A. Yes. e-mail and it has the name Steve Hicks at the top Q. And it has a number of activities 6 in the left corner. Do you see that? listed. The first one is initial quotations due. A. Yes, sir. Do you see that? 8 Q. And if you read the first two sentences A. Yep. 9 after good afternoon, the first two sentences of Q. Then it says connectivity exercise? the first full paragraph: "Thank you for 11 11 Q. Are you familiar with what the term returning our category questionnaire. Moving into 12 12 the next phase of the review, you are now invited connectivity exercise means? 13 13 to submit quotations for Publix brand eggs." Do A. No. sir. 14 you see that? 14 Q. If you go down a few more rows, you see 15 15 the term mock auction? A. Yes. 16 16 A. Yes. Q. Would this e-mail be an example of the 17 17 category review process? Q. Are you familiar with that term? 18 18 A. From MSP? 19 19 Q. From MSP, sure. Q. And then the next row down it says live 20 20 A. Um, I'm assuming it would. Just this is auction. Do you see that? 21 21 a document from Steve Hicks. A. Yes. 22 Q. And who is Steve Hicks? Q. Are you familiar with the term "live

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

33 (Pages 126 to 129)

128 126 auction"? A. Yes, sir. A. No, sir. Q. Do you see the third bullet point says: Q. So you -- you're not aware of whether "The selected vendor's products will meet the Publix held live auctions to determine the -- from specifications established for Publix brand whom Publix would buy shell eggs. products. Publix reserves the right to refuse any A. To my understanding, we did not. product that does not meet or exceed the standards Q. Okay. So turning back to the page established, of the established NRB." bearing the number 7005. Is it your testimony What does NRB stand for, if you know? that you're not familiar with this document? A. National retail brand. 10 10 A. I am now. It's in front of me. Q. So is it Publix's policy that its store 11 11 brand products had to meet or exceed the standards Q. Are you able to testify about the 12 12 various vendor requirements that are listed on of a comparable national brand? 13 this document? A. Yes. 14 14 Q. So for example, for private label egg, A. An example of a vendor requirement would 15 be -was it Publix's policy that the liquid egg it was 16 16 MR. GERMAINE: It's the title here. buying had to meet or exceed the standards of 17 17 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: ConAgra Egg Beaters? 18 18 Q. Well, for example, at the top of the A. Yes. 19 page, it says payment terms and then says: "All Q. And was the subject to negotiation or 20 20 was this something the supplier had to live with? prices to include direct store delivery cost for 21 two to three deliveries per week to stores A. Something they had to live with. 22 designated by the supplier on the store locator Q. Okay. To your knowledge, are all of 127 129 sheet." these vendor requirements listed on this page A. Yes. nonnegotiable? Q. Are you familiar with that -- is it your MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. understanding that Publix required its vendors. A. Yes. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: when soliciting or when submitting bids, to base the prices off of a two to three delivery-per-week Q. So put another way, for each of the term? requirements listed on this page -- withdrawn. So put another way, each of the vendor requirements A. Yes, sir. Q. Okay. Do you have any understanding, listed on this document is non-negotiable? 10 other than this document in front of you, that MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. 11 11 A. Um, you're speaking in absolutes. Yes. Publix required that of its suppliers? 12 12 A. That's our program. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 13 13 Q. It is? Q. Yes. Okay. You can set that aside. 14 A. Yes. 14 A. Do we still need 8? 15 15 Q. Does Publix always require net 14 days Q. You know, you can set them aside. If we 16 16 for invoicing? need to pull it later, we can do so. 17 17 A. On eggs? MR. GERMAINE: We've been going about an 18 18 Q. Yes. hour or so. Do you want to try and go a 19 19 little bit longer and then break for lunch or A. As of this document, obviously we did. 20 20 how do you feel? Q. Okay. Down under the heading quality 21 assurance, do you see the four bullet points that MR. RAYLE: That's fine. 22 MR. GERMAINE: Okay. Is that okay with are listed there?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

34 (Pages 130 to 133)

130 132 you, Counsel? Q. It also appears on this page. Is your MR. SCHWINGLER: What was that? answer the same? Are you familiar with the phrase "connectivity exercise" on this document? MR. GERMAINE: Just go for a little while longer and break for lunch at a convenient place. We've hit an hour, so I Q. How about the phrase "mock auction"? was just giving the witness an opportunity --Are you familiar with that? MR. SCHWINGLER: Yeah. No, that's fine. A. No. Just let me know whenever. I think we'll --Q. Are you familiar with the phrase "live it will be a while until there's a logical auction"? 10 stopping point where we can stop. It doesn't 10 A. No. 11 matter. Q. To your knowledge, did Publix hold live 12 MR. GERMAINE: Okay. 12 auctions to determine its suppliers of private 13 MR. SCHWINGLER: What exhibit number is 14 14 this? A. To my knowledge, no, I don't think we 15 15 THE COURT REPORTER: 10. did. 16 (Wilson 10 Received and Marked) MR. GERMAINE: For the Record, you 17 17 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: stopped your question at the end. You meant 18 18 Q. Mr. Wilson, we've handed you what's been liquid eggs. 19 19 marked as Exhibit 10, which is a document bearing BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 20 20 the Bates range PUB_EGGS_008209 and continues Q. Private label liquid eggs, yes. 21 21 until 008230. Once again, you're free to read as A. To my knowledge, no. Once again, this 22 is controlled by MSP. much of this as you feel you need to in order to 131 133 Q. It is. Okay. So as the buyer, you said be comfortable with it and answer the questions. I will direct your attention to the page MSP controls this category review process? with the number 8225 in the lower right corner, which is near the end. Actually, why don't we go Q. At what point does the buyer become back one page before, 8224. The page says "Publix involved in the decision, the decision about Category Review, Publix Brand Egg Substitutes" at purchasing eggs? the stop. Do you see that? A. Deciding on the supplier? A. Yes. Q. From whom to purchase eggs. Q. Are you familiar with this document? A. When MSP compiles all the information, 10 A. Yes. sir. they give it to us. 11 Q. What is this document? 11 Q. And then it comes to the buyer? 12 12 A. It's the Publix brand egg substitutes A. The buyer and the category manager and 13 13 category review. the business development director. 14 14 Q. And so this is a schedule of events that Q. And the information that MSP compiles, 15 15 will occur as part of the category review for does that include pricing information? 16 16 private label eggs? A. Yes. 17 17 A. Yes. Q. So when, when the buyer first becomes Q. And before I -- with respect to the involved, the supplier has already submitted a 19 19 prior exhibit, I believe you testified that you price quotation; is that correct? 20 20 were not familiar with the phrase "connectivity A. Yes. 21 21 exercise"? Q. Okay. So you're not familiar with how 22 A. Yes. that price quotation was generated, correct?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

35 (Pages 134 to 137)

134 136 A. MSP is in charge of that. A. No, sir. Q. You only know what the, what the price Q. If you look under the pricing was when it was given to, to the buyer, correct? parameters, on the left it says "pricing A. Yes. parameters" and then there's some bullet points. Q. So it possible, but you don't know And the fourth bullet point down is called whether that price was determined through a live pricing. Do you see that? auction, correct? A. Yes. A. Correct. Q. And then it says to the right: Fixed 9 Q. And is Steve Hicks somebody that would base pricing: "Dead net cost quotations must 10 10 have the information about whether Publix remain fixed and valid for one year after initial 11 11 conducted live auctions? shipment." 12 12 A. I'm not -- I don't know. Can you explain to me what dead net cost 13 13 Q. Okay. Turning to the next page, number quotations are? 14 14 8225 in the lower right corner. At the top it A. Um, that would be fixed cost. 15 15 says "Publix Brand Egg Substitutes Vendor Q. And is that -- by dead net cost, is that 16 16 Requirements." Are you familiar with this the, sort of the out-of-pocket price that Publix 17 17 document? would pay for the product? 18 18 A. To the point that it's in front of me A. Yes. 19 19 now. Q. And then it says: "These quotations 20 20 Q. But you haven't seen this document must remain fixed and valid for one year after 21 21 before today? initial shipment." Does that mean that Publix 22 22 A. No, sir. would pay the same price for an entire year for 135 137 Q. Okay. And you haven't seen -- assuming that product? this is an example of a vendor requirement MR. GERMAINE: Objection. document that MSP used as part of a category A. As quoted in this document, yes. review process, have you seen any other documents BY MR. SCHWINGLER: like this? Any other -- let me rephrase. Q. Other than what's in this document, do Apart from this document in front of you have any understanding of whether the fixed you, have you ever seen a list of vendor price would remain fixed for a year? requirements prepared by MSP for the private label A. No. eggs? Q. Okay. The last sentence in that little 10 A. Apart from this document in front of me? paragraph says, very, variable indices and their 11 Q. Yes. 11 review -- I don't want to skip over and lose 12 A. Have I seen other MSP documents? context. So after the term formula based pricing: 13 13 Q. Have you ever seen a list of vendor "Specified fixed indices must remain fixed for one 14 14 requirements for private label eggs, liquid eggs. year." Do you see that? 15 A. That would be this document. 16 16 Q. Correct. But other than this? Q. And then it says: "Variable indices and 17 17 A. I just testified I haven't seen this the review frequency would be mutually agreed to 18 before. by vendor and Publix." Do you see that? 19 19 Q. Sure. But other, other than this A. Yes. 20 20 Q. Do you understand what the term document now, have you, have you seen any other 21 lists of vendor requirements for private label "variable indices" refers to in this document? 22 eggs? A. No.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

36 (Pages 138 to 141)

138 140 Q. And do you understand what the term me an example of, for a shell egg, what is Publix "fixed indices" refers to in this document? looking for in terms of quality? A. No. I have an idea, but I don't know A. High-quality product. No breaks, no what it means. chips. Q. So understanding that you don't know, Q. For a private label liquid egg what is your understanding? substitute, what quality factors does Publix A. Fixed would probably be packaging cost. Variable would probably be product inside the A. CQA is in charge of the, the testing of packaging. the products. 10 10 Q. Okay. Then under quality assurance near Q. So are you familiar with any -- whether 11 11 the bottom of the page, the fourth bullet, it Publix imposes a bacteria plate count requirement? 12 12 says: "The selected vendor's products will meet A. That would be a CQA question. 13 13 the specification established for Publix brand Q. Other than quality -- let's talk about 14 14 products. Publix reserves the right to refuse any shell eggs now. Other than quality, what 15 product that does not meet or exceed standards of 15 non-price factors does Publix consider when 16 16 the established NRB." Do you see that? determining which suppliers to use? 17 17 A. Yes. A. Supply. 18 18 Q. And I believe you testified before that Q. Do you mean the ability to supply a 19 with respect to private label eggs, the sufficient volume? 20 20 established NRB was ConAgra. A. Yes. 21 21 A. For liquid eggs? Q. Does -- is the reason Publix buys from 22 Q. For private label liquid, yeah. only two shell egg suppliers, because there aren't 139 very many shell egg suppliers that can supply a A. Yes. Q. And so, the private label liquid product sufficient volume to meet Publix's needs? Publix was purchasing was required to meet or A. Well, one of our two suppliers bought exceed the standards of ConAgra's Egg Beaters two other suppliers, so that's one reason why we product; is that correct? deal with two. But there's, there's a limited A. Yes. number of companies that can supply Publix with Q. So if you, if you were not involved in enough eggs for, for a large amount of stores. the category review process, is it fair to say Q. And it's important to Publix that have a that you have no knowledge about whether the reliable supply of shell eggs? 10 requirements for bids changed between 2002 and the A. Yes. 11 end of 2008? 11 Q. So there's never going to be an empty 12 A. No, sir. refrigerator at a Publix store that doesn't have 13 13 Q. So you're not aware of whether ConAgra any shell eggs? 14 14 required fixed pricing in 2002 and then changed A. That's our goal. It doesn't always 15 15 that policy? 16 16 A. No, sir. Q. What non-price factors, other than 17 17 quality, does Publix consider when determining Q. Once the -- once bids come in from shell egg suppliers, what factors, other than price, which supplier to use when purchasing private 19 19 does Publix consider when determining which label liquid eggs? 20 20 supplier to use? A. Repeat that question, please. 21 21 A. Quality. Q. Talking only about private label liquid Q. Quality? And by quality, can you give eggs.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

37 (Pages 142 to 145)

142 144 A. Only liquid eggs, yes, sir. A. I'm not sure. I'm not aware. Q. What non-price factors, other than Q. Are you aware of why Publix uses an quality, does Publix consider when determining Urner Barry market based price to purchase the which supplier to use? Publix branded shell eggs? A. Other than quality? A. Am I aware why? Q. Does reliability, is that something that Q. Yeah. Publix considers? A. No. A. Yes. Q. Go ahead. Q. Is the ability to produce a sufficient A. The Urner Barry market lists the --10 10 quantity something that Publix would consider? updates the cost of the supply every day. 11 11 A. Part of reliability, yes, sir. Q. Sure, but why does Publix choose to buy 12 12 Q. Once the, once the suppliers submit its shell eggs off of a market basis? 13 13 their bids for shell eggs, does any additional A. Um, I don't know. Other than that's the 14 14 negotiation between Publix and the supplier take way it's been done. 15 15 place? Q. Has Publix considered other, other ways 16 16 A. Um, I'm sure there was in 2000 -- the to purchase shell eggs other than market basis? 17 17 last review, I'm sure there was some. A. Private label shell eggs? 18 18 Q. When was the last review, do you know? Q. Yes. A. I think your document said 2005. A. No, sir. 2.0 20 MR. GERMAINE: This one is from 2008. Q. So Publix has not considered a, a price 21 21 THE WITNESS: That's liquid. 2008. that would be tied to a grain market, for example? 22 A. Until you mentioned that today, I had A. But you said shell eggs. 143 145 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: never heard of that before. Q. For shell eggs. Q. Have you heard of the term "cost plus A. So that was 2005 was the document that pricing"? you handed to me. A. Cost plus pricing? Yes, sir. Q. Sure. Are you aware of any category Q. What does that mean to you? reviews that have occurred since 2005? A. That would be a cost plus the factor A. No, sir. included in the price of the product to cover MR. GERMAINE: For shell eggs. packaging or materials or, et cetera. Q. And did Publix ever consider cost plus BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 10 10 Q. For shell eggs. pricing for Publix branded shell eggs? 11 A. No, sir. 11 A. No. 12 12 Q. And are you aware of any category Q. Did Publix ever ask its vendors if they 13 13 reviews that have occurred for private label offered different pricing methods? 14 14 liquid eggs since 2005 --A. Not that I'm aware of. 15 15 A. 2008. Q. Is it possible that Publix might have 16 16 Q. -- or 2008? done so as part of the category review process but 17 17 A. Is the document here. Since 2008? you're just not familiar with it? 18 Q. Yeah. A. It's possible. 19 19 MR. SCHWINGLER: Why don't -- can I do A. No, sir. 20 20 one more exhibit and is that a good time for Q. Are you aware of any category reviews 21 21 for private label liquid eggs that occurred lunch? between 2002 and 2008? THE WITNESS: Yes.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

38 (Pages 146 to 149)

146 148 MR. GERMAINE: It's up to the witness. going off the Record. MR. SCHWINGLER: Is that good for you? (Proceedings recessed at 12:09 p.m.) THE WITNESS: Yes. (Proceedings resumed at 1:14 p.m.) THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 1:14. We're MR. SCHWINGLER: Exhibit 11. (Wilson 11 Received and Marked) back on the Record. MR. SCHWINGLER: I think we're on BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Mr. Wilson, we've handed you what's been Exhibit 12 now. marked as Exhibit 11, which is a single-page (Wilson 12 Received and Marked) BY MR. SCHWINGLER: e-mail bearing the Bates number PUB_EGGS_016558. 10 10 It appears to have been sent from Chris Smith to Q. Mr. Wilson, we've handed you what's been 11 11 marked as Exhibit 12, a document bearing Bates Jeff Cutler on December 23rd, 2003. 12 12 range PUB_EGGS_006959 through 006997. It's a Do you want to take a moment to review 13 13 fairly lengthy document. And as always, you're the document and then -- let me know once you've 14 14 done so? free to read as much as you need to. But I'll 15 direct your attention to -- it will be the fourth A. Yes, sir. 16 16 Q. First of all, who is Chris Smith, if you page of the document. It has the Bates range 6962 17 or the Bates number 6962. 17 18 18 So I'll direct your attention A. This is pertaining to price that we're 19 specifically to line 27 on the left side of the not talking about today. 20 page, there are sort of rows and columns. I'd ask 20 Q. This is -- is this part of the 21 you to read row 27. manufacturing business unit that --A. Yes, sir. 22 A. It says in the e-mail, Publix flat price 147 149 -- Lakeland or Bucknell payment terms. Jeff Q. And so, before I ask you about question Cutler, plant manager, Cutler at Abbeville, LLC. 27, if you turn back to the front page of this This is a product that we don't sell in the document -- actually, I believe the second page of grocery. the exhibit, it has the Bates number 6960. The Q. So this is a, this is a -- relates to top of the page it says "Publix Super Markets, liquid whole eggs, is that your understanding? Inc. Qualifying Questionnaire, Publix Brand X." A. That's what it looks like to me. Do you see that? Q. And the grocery business unit does not A. Yes, sir. Q. Do you recognize this document? purchase or sell liquid whole egg, correct? 10 A. Just -- it looks like it's a 30-pound A. Um, it's in front of me now. I've never 11 11 seen it before. bag or in a box and a 2000-pound tote. So no, 12 12 Q. Have you seen, other than this specific sir, we don't sell that. 13 13 Q. So you're not familiar with that product document, are you familiar with any questionnaires 14 14 being sold by the grocery unit? that Publix sends to egg suppliers? 15 15 A. No, sir. A. Yes, sir. 16 16 MR. GERMAINE: Can you imagine? Q. And is it typical for Publix to send 17 17 questionnaires that ask suppliers to respond to MR. SCHWINGLER: All right. Well --18 18 MR. BJORK: Somebody really likes eggs. various questions? 19 19 MR. SCHWINGLER: If you don't know A. Yes, sir. 20 20 Q. And returning to the -- to number 27 on anything about it, then we'll go get lunch. 21 THE WITNESS: Okay. page 6962, there appears to be a typo, but the THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 12:09. We're question 27 is: "Are your plans in compliance

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

39 (Pages 150 to 153)

150 152 with the FMI-NCCR Animal Welfare Guidelines";is in any discussions regarding whether to put this that correct? question in the questionnaire? A. Yes, sir. A. No, sir. I was not in the buying Q. First of all, what is FMI, if you know? department in 2002, so I wouldn't have been part A. Food Market Institute. of the discussions. Q. And just for the Record, on line 27, on Q. And what do they do? page 6962, what was the response from the supplier A. They, they are a group of food market -to the question in number 27? they are a group that regulates or tries to get A. Yes. regulations pushed through Washington on different 10 10 agendas. Q. Yes. Turning to line 30 on that same 11 11 page, it says: What other pricing systems do you Q. So is it an industry group that 12 12 offer shell egg customers (cost plus), et cetera? represents retail grocery stores? 13 13 A. Yes, sir. Why was Publix asking shell egg suppliers what 14 other pricing system they offer? 14 Q. Okay. And is Publix a member of FMI? 15 A. Fact gathering. A. Yes. sir. 16 Q. Was Publix considering using a pricing Q. Has Publix been a member of FMI since 17 system other than an Urner Barry market base price 17 2002? 18 for its shell eggs? A. Yes, sir. A. Not that I'm aware of, no, sir. 19 Q. And do you know what NCCR stands for? 20 Q. And is it -- isn't it correct that 20 A. Um, not off the top of my head, no, sir. Cal-Maine or the supplier responded to that Q. Do you know what is referred to here question by referencing -- stating: "We would 22 with the phrase "FMI-NCCR Animal Welfare 151 153 Guidelines"? discuss a cost plus or sliding scale (greater A. I've seen it before, yes, sir. discount when market is higher) as discussed at Q. What's your understanding of that meeting." Is that, is that what the supplier's phrase? response was? A. Yes, sir. A. FMI is the Food Market Institute and animal welfare guidelines are the guidelines that Q. Are you familiar with the meeting that's they, they hold as the standard for companies to referred to in that answer? A. I'm assuming they were meeting with follow for --Q. Sure. And why, why was Publix asking them. 10 10 its suppliers whether their plans were in Q. But you weren't -- you don't know 11 11 specifically what -- when that meeting occurred? compliance with the FMI-NCCR Animal Welfare 12 12 Guidelines? A. It would've been after this date. This 13 13 was on -- was there a date on this document, when A. Fact gathering. 14 Q. Was it important to Publix that its 14 this was sent out? No later than December 14. 15 15 suppliers are in compliance with those guidelines? 2004. So I'm sure it would've happened after 16 16 December 14th, 2004. A. I think it was more or less just fact 17 17 gathering. Q. For the Record, where are you seeing the 18 Q. Are you personally familiar with why date December 14th? I see it, on --19 19 Publix included this question in the questionnaire A. Down at the bottom there: "Return the 20 20 completed questionnaire electronically, if to suppliers? 21 21 A. Just gathering information. possible, to steve.hicks@Publix.com." Q. The bottom left corner of page 6962, Q. Sure. But are you -- were you involved

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

40 (Pages 154 to 157)

	154	156
1	correct?	sort of is an example of the quality standards
2	A. Yes, sir.	that Publix imposed on its shell egg suppliers?
3	Q. Okay. Do you know what a sliding scale	³ A. If not higher than that, yes, sir.
4	pricing system is?	⁴ Q. Do you believe Publix imposed higher
5	A. No, sir.	standards than is set forth in this document?
6	Q. And I take it you're not aware whether	⁶ A. We hold all of our suppliers to high
7	Publix considered purchasing shell eggs using a	standards. Just as we do ourselves.
8	sliding scale system?	⁸ Q. And Publix product quality is
9	A. No, sir.	⁹ important to Publix, correct?
10	Q. I take any questions about the deli,	¹⁰ A. Yes, sir.
11	business units, egg procurement are better for	Q. And Publix wants to sell its customers a
12	tomorrow's witness?	high-quality product
13	MR. GERMAINE: Yes.	A. Yes, sir.
14	BY MR. SCHWINGLER:	Q correct? And Publix holds their
15	Q. And you wouldn't have any knowledge	products out as being high in quality; is that
16	about the purchases of eggs or egg products by the	16 correct?
17	deli business unit.	A. Yes.
18	A. No, sir.	Q. Under the heading product description,
19	MR. SCHWINGLER: This would be 13.	do you see that paragraph?
20	(Wilson 13 Received and Marked)	A. Yes, sir.
21	BY MR. SCHWINGLER:	Q. And at the last sentence, where it said,
22	Q. Mr. Wilson, I've handed you what's been	it says: "Product shall be accordance with the
	155	157
1		industry's animal welfare guidelines and carton
2	marked as Exhibit 13. It's a document bearing the Bates range PUB_EGGS_007150 through 007157. And	industry's animal welfare guidelines and carton shall bear the, quote, 'animal care certificate',
3	I'd ask you to turn to the second page of that	quote, logo." Do you see that?
4	document, Bates number 7151, and review that	4 A. Yes, sir.
5	document briefly, if you could.	Q. Are you familiar with what the phrase
6	A. Yes, sir.	the industry's animal welfare guidelines" is
7	Q. Are you familiar with this document?	referring to here?
8	A. Yes, sir. I've seen it. I had seen it	8 A. Yes. sir.
9	before.	9 Q. And what would that be?
10	Q. The top of this document says "Product	A. That would be the guidelines for animal
11	Specification for Publix Jumbo Eggs".	care.
12	A. Yes, sir.	Q. Would those be the guidelines put out by
13	Q. Are you even though you haven't seen	the United Egg Producers?
14	this document before, but have you seen other	A. The ones approved by FMI, I believe.
15	documents defining the product specifications for	Q. So the when Publix uses the phrase
16	Publix eggs?	the "industry's animal welfare guidelines" in this
17	A. Not in this form, no, sir.	document, they're referring to the FMI guidelines?
18	Q. Before you testified Publix considers	A. I think they're the same.
19	quality when purchasing shell eggs; is that	Q. And are you familiar with the Animal
20	correct?	²⁰ Care Certified logo?
21	A. Yes, sir, definitely.	A. Yes, sir.
22	Q. Would you agree that this document, it	Q. And do you understand that that refers
II		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

41 (Pages 158 to 161)

158 160 to the logo associated with the United Egg A. Well, our packaging has it on it and if Producers Animal Welfare Program? we were buying something from someone that wasn't A. Yes, sir. Animal Care Certified, we'd be lying to our Q. And are you aware that at some point customer. after 2004, the logo or the term became the UEP Q. Sure. So my original question was, at Certified Program instead of the Animal Care this point in time, was Publix requiring the Certified program? Animal Care Certified logo for its shell egg A. Yes, sir. purchases? Q. So when I refer to the Animal Care A. It was on the packaging, yes, sir. 10 Certified Program, you understand that to mean the 10 Q. So the answer to my question, though, is 11 UEP Certified Program and vice versa? 11 yes, correct? 12 A. Yes, sir. A. Yes, sir. It was on the packaging. We 13 Q. So would you agree, based on this 13 had to. 14 document, that at least as of December 10th, 2004, 14 Q. Who, within Publix, was responsible for 15 that Publix was requiring its shell egg suppliers 15 determining specifications that are imposed upon 16 to be in compliance with the FMI Animal Welfare 16 shell egg suppliers? 17 Guidelines; is that correct? 17 A. I wouldn't think it would be one person. 18 A. Yes, sir. Q. What job title or division would be 19 Q. And the -- at that point in time, Publix 19 responsible for that? 20 was also requiring its shell egg suppliers to 20 A. I believe it would be a team effort. 21 provide the Animal Care Certified logo on the 21 Q. Okay. Who would be on that team? 22 cartons? 22 A. People from different areas. MSP, CQA, 159 161 A. Yes, sir. buying. Q. Was Publix aware, as of December 10th, Q. As the buyer, when you were the buyer 2004, that in order to use the Animal Care for eggs, did you contribute your views on what Certified logo, a producer was required to be in product specifications should be? compliance with the UEP, at the time known as A. For shell eggs? Animal Care Certified program? A. No, sir. They were already established. A. Yes, sir. Q. All right. You can set this document Q. To your knowledge, was Publix willing to negotiate with suppliers on whether the shell egg aside. 10 cartons would bear the Animal Care Certified logo? (Wilson 14 Received and Marked) 11 A. Were we willing to? 11 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 12 12 Q. Let me phrase it another way. Was the Q. Mr. Wilson, I've handed you what's been 13 13 Animal Care Certified logo a requirement to sell marked as Exhibit Number 14. It bears the Bates 14 14 shell eggs to Publix? range PUB_EGGS_008645 through 008659. I'll direct 15 15 A. It was on our packaging, so we -your attention to the fourth page of the document 16 16 Q. So at this point in time, December of with the number 8649 in the bottom right-hand 17 17 2004, Publix would not have purchased shell eggs corner, which for the Record, appears to be an from a non-certified producer; is that correct? e-mail from Elise Richardson to Gerald Bondock on 19 19 A. We wouldn't have lied to our customers October 24th, 2002. If you could review the 20 20 and said it was if they weren't. document and let me know once you've had a chance. 21 21 Q. So when you say you wouldn't have lied A. Okay. Yes, sir. 22 Q. Mr. Wilson, who is Elise Richardson? to your customers, can you explain what you mean?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

42 (Pages 162 to 165)

162 164 A. Um, I'm not sure. Publix brand private label egg substitute; is that Q. Do you know who Gerald Bondock is? A. Yes, sir. A. I know the name, but I don't --Q. How about Floyd Freeman? Q. And does this -- I know this e-mail A. Yes. sir. wasn't sent to you or from you, but does this Q. Who is Floyd Freeman? e-mail refresh your recollection on that issue? A. He's in charge of MSP. A. It says there was an auction. I still Q. He runs MSP? am not aware of any. A. Yes, sir. Q. Is your understanding of the, the second 10 10 Q. So is he -- was he the supervisor of sentence in this e-mail, that the low bidder in 11 11 Steve Hicks? the auction did not perform well in the taste 12 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 13 Q. And the subject line of this, this A. Am I able to read that? Yes, sir. 14 14 e-mail at page 8648 is titled "Egg Substitutes"; Q. Okay. And then the next sentence says: 15 15 is that correct? "Only two of the products compared favorably to the NRB", correct? A. Yes, sir. 17 17 Q. The first sentence of the e-mail states: A. Yes, sir. 18 18 "The taste panel for this category proved to be Q. And then it says: "The team has 19 very informative." recommended that we go with the lowest of these 20 20 two bids. Michaels \$990,105 resulting in a" --Does Publix, is one of the criteria on 21 21 which Publix evaluates retail egg substitutes, the I'll skip the rest of the sentence there. 22 taste of the product? Do you understand that sentence to mean 163 165 A. Yes, sir. that Publix is -- that the results of the test Q. And so does Publix actually have a taste influenced Publix's decision on which supplier to test before deciding to buy a retail egg hire for this product? substitute product? A. That's how it reads to me. A. For the private label? For Publix? Q. Is that consistent with your general Q. Sure. For the Publix private label. understanding of Publix's egg procurement A. Yes. practices, that they would weigh -- give Q. Does Publix hold a taste test before significant weight to a taste test? deciding to buy a national branded product? A. Yes, sir. 10 10 A. Not generally, no, sir. Q. Because Publix does not want to be 11 11 Q. The second sentence of the e-mail says, selling a Publix-branded product that doesn't 12 12 "Unfortunately, the product from the low bidder in taste very good? 13 13 A. Yes. the auction did not compare favorably with the NRB 14 (or anything else)." Do you see that? 14 Q. All right. Are you familiar with the 15 15 A. Yes, sir. criteria that are used in the taste testing for 16 16 Q. And is the NRB for the retail egg private label eggs, liquid eggs? 17 17 substitute, ConAgra in this instance? A. I'm sure it would be taste. A. Yes, sir. Q. But there aren't -- other than does it 19 Q. And that's the Egg Beaters product? 19 taste good, yes or no, are there other criteria 20 20 that Publix uses when evaluating taste? A. Yes, sir. 21 21 Q. So my understanding -- you had testified A. Other adjectives? Is that what you're earlier that you're not aware of any auctions for asking me? Other adjectives used like good, bad

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

43 (Pages 166 to 169)

168 166 salty or sweet or -in order to get a higher quality product? Q. Well, salty or sweet would be --A. I mean, is that what you're asking? Q. To your knowledge, did Publix ever have Q. Yeah. I mean, for example, does it quality issues with an egg supplier at the end of taste salty, does it taste sweet? Are these -- do 2008? you know if there's a list of, sort of criteria A. To my knowledge, no, sir. that the taste testers would use? Q. Would that be true for both shell eggs A. I would imagine it would be as many and private label liquid? 9 adjectives as they -- if it was chemical tasting A. Yes. 10 10 or if it tasted like, whatever it tasted like. It Q. We touched on this earlier. Other than 11 11 could vary as greatly as the dictionary. the private label liquid and the, sort of the 12 12 Q. Are there specific factors that Publix liquid egg substitutes, are you familiar with any 13 13 is looking for when tasting those products? liquid egg products that are sold at retail by 14 14 A. Quality. I mean, I don't know how to Publix? 15 15 word it any other way than that. A. Other than label and branding? 16 16 Q. Would Publix be interested in -- does Q. Yeah. 17 17 Publix consider whether the product tastes like a, A. No, sir. 18 18 Q. Are you familiar with any frozen egg a regular egg? 19 19 A. We want it to taste as good as possible. products that are sold at retail by Publix? 20 20 Q. Sure. But isn't the objective of the A. I believe there is a frozen liquid egg, 21 21 liquid egg substitute, to be a healthier isn't there? Or we used to. I don't know if it's 22 still in the frozen department or not. But I alternative to a regular egg? 167 169 A. Yes, sir. believe we used to sell a frozen Egg Beater. Q. And --Q. Was that a -- do you remember whether A. It is egg. I mean, you do realize that, that was a ConAgra product? right? A. If it had the Egg Beater name, it would Q. The -- what I'm trying to understand is, have to be. is Publix looking for a private label egg Q. So you do recall it bore the Egg Beater substitute that most closely resembles a regular egg from a taste standpoint? A. I believe we did, yes, sir. That was 9 A. Yes. many years ago. 10 10 Q. Okay. Does Publix ever pay a higher Q. Ballpark, how many years ago? 11 price in order to obtain a higher quality shell 11 A. I've been with Publix for 25 years, so 12 12 more than 12; less than 25. egg? 13 13 A. Um, we get our shell eggs from our Q. So before 2002? 14 supplier. 14 A. Um, it could've been after that date. 15 15 Q. The e-mail we just looked at, it 16 16 Q. Okay. Who does Publix, the Publix appeared that Publix was rejecting the lowest cost 17 17 bidder because the product didn't taste very good. grocery unit consider to be its customers? 18 18 Going with a higher price product. A. Our stores. 19 19 A. This is liquid eggs, though. You just Q. The actual Publix stores, themselves? 20 20 asked me about shell eggs. A. That's who we service. 21 21 Q. For shell eggs. For liquid, for private Q. That's who you service. And then the label liquid, was Publix willing to pay more money stores, themselves, sell to the consuming public,

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

44 (Pages 170 to 173)

170	172
¹ correct?	any other business units that sell shell eggs for
² A. Yes, sir.	retail sale?
³ Q. When you say the business unit considers	MR. GERMAINE: At Publix?
4 the stores to be their customer, does the business	BY MR. SCHWINGLER:
5 unit actually sell shell eggs to the stores?	⁵ Q. At any other Publix business units that
6 A. We take care of all the issues, so the	sell shell eggs at retail?
stores can sell the product to the customer.	⁷ A. No, sir, not to my knowledge.
⁸ Q. Sure. I just want to understand, is the	⁸ Q. Okay. Who within Publix is responsible
grocery retail business unit serving as a	for determining the price at which Publix sells
distributor for the	shell eggs?
¹¹ MR. GERMAINE: Objection.	11 A. The buyer.
A. I wouldn't call us a distributor for the	Q. So that would've been you in 2007?
13 stores, no, sir.	A. Yes, sir.
14 BY MR. SCHWINGLER:	Q. So you both so you, as the buyer,
¹⁵ Q. Let me put this another way: Does the	were in charge of setting the price that is
same the stores aren't independently owned,	charged to the customer in the store?
¹⁷ correct?	A. Yes, sir.
¹⁸ A. No, sir.	Q. And how did you determine what price to
Q. They are owned by, by Publix Super	charge?
²⁰ Markets, Incorporated, correct?	MR. GERMAINE: Again, I'm going to
21 A. Yes, sir.	restate my downstream objection here. The
Q. Which is the same company that owns what	witness can answer on his individual basis.
Q: Which is the same company that sime what	Williago dan anowor on the individual basis.
171	173
we're referring to here as the grocery retail	¹ A. As many different criteria.
² business unit.	² BY MR. SCHWINGLER:
³ A. Yes, sir.	³ Q. Can you give me an example of one
Q. Okay. So when you say that the stores	⁴ criteria that you used when you were the buyer for
5 are your customers, you mean more in the sense of	shell eggs when determining the price to charge
6 that that's who you're providing services to?	for retail shell eggs?
A. Yes. We serve the stores.	⁷ A. Yes, sir. Cost.
⁸ Q. But you're not actually buying a product	⁸ Q. The cost that Publix paid?
⁹ and then selling it to the stores.	⁹ A. Yes, sir.
¹⁰ A. No, sir.	Q. Can you give me another example?
¹¹ Q. Okay. I may have asked this before.	11 A. Market.
Does Publix ever serve as a distributor of shell	Q. What do you mean by market?
13 eggs?	A. Where the eggs are being sold.
¹⁴ A. No, sir.	Q. Location?
¹⁵ Q. Does Publix ever serve as the	¹⁵ A. Yes, sir.
distributor of egg products?	Q. And how would the location impact the
A. No, sir. Not that I'm aware of.	price?
¹⁸ Q. Other than so the grocery retail	A. Again, many different factors.
business unit sells shell eggs for retail sale as	Q. Having to do with the socioeconomic
we've discussed extensively, correct?	A. Competition. There's all kind of
A. Yes, sir.	21 factors involved.
Q. And, and to your knowledge, are there	Q. So whether there are other stores in

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

45 (Pages 174 to 177)

174 176 that location that are -- and what prices those A. They could've changed weekly. stores are charging? Q. Would, would -- did they always change A. Yes, sir. weekly? Q. Are pricing decisions made on a A. No, sir. store-by-store basis? Q. And so what would cause Publix to, to make a price change for retail shell eggs? A. Um, no. Q. They're not -- you indicated that A. Cost change. Q. Would that be the biggest driver? location could be a factor in the price. Now, does location -- how does location impact the A. Yes. 10 10 price if the price is not set on a store-by-store Q. Are you familiar with the term "loss 11 11 leader"? basis? 12 12 A. Yes. A. There could be a hundred stores in a 13 13 group or --Q. What does that term mean to you? 14 A. To me, it means selling a product at a Q. Oh, so you --15 15 A. Or 20 stores in a group or 500. It's very low margin in order to attract customers into 16 16 not a store-by-store basis. your store. 17 17 Q. Does -- at any point from 2002 until the Q. It's not necessarily, you know, one 18 18 present, has Publix used shell eggs as loss store at a time, but you may look at groups of 19 19 stores in determining the price? leaders? 20 20 A. Yes, sir. A. I'm sure they have, yes, sir. 21 21 Q. So there have been moments, in between Q. Is that true for liquid egg substitutes 22 2002 and present, when Publix has sold shell eggs as well? 175 177 A. Yes, sir. at an intentionally lower price in order to Q. When determining the price at which you generate more volume? sell branded shell eggs, is the process the same MR. GERMAINE: Renew my downstream objection. as it is for Publix branded shell eggs? A. Um --MR. SCHWINGLER: Sure. I'll give you a MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. standing objection on that. MR. SCHWINGLER: Let me, let me withdraw A. Yes. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Did Publix ever use -- did Publix ever 10 10 Q. Does Publix have the ability to offer a lower on shell eggs to attract customers 11 determine the price at which it will sell branded 11 to its stores more generally? 12 12 shell eggs? A. That would be the only reason. 13 13 A. Yes. Q. So it wasn't just that Publix wanted to 14 Q. So Publix doesn't have to sell a price 14 sell more shell eggs. Publix wanted the lower egg 15 15 imposed by the supplier of the shell eggs. prices to attract customers to the store to buy 16 16 A. No. other products, correct? 17 17 Q. Okay. How frequently -- let's just, A. Yes, sir. We try to get as many from 2002 to the end of 2008, how frequently did customers as we can. 19 Publix change its shell egg prices? 19 Q. Does Publix have any records of when it 20 20 A. Private label? -- withdrawn. When -- do individual Publix stores 21 21 Q. Sure. Let's start with private label determine when to use eggs as a loss leader? 22 shell eggs. A. No, sir.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

46 (Pages 178 to 181)

178 180 whether to offer a promotion for shell eggs? Q. Who makes that decision? A. The buyer. A. Um, I don't understand the question. Do Q. The buyer. And can the buyer make that we consider the price of other products whenever decision for multiple stores at once? we're pricing eggs? Like, do we consider price of A. Yes, sir. any other product in the store when we're pricing Q. Can the buyer make that decision for eggs, is that your question? some but not all Publix stores? Q. The question is, does Publix ever offer A. Yes, sir. If he chooses. promotions um, where a customer gets a lower shell egg price in connection with the sale of another Q. Just off, if you know, approximately how 10 10 many Publix stores are there currently? product or service? 11 11 A. Currently today, 1076. A. Oh. A coupon or, or buy two of these 12 12 Q. And what was the approximate number, and get a dollar off of eggs, is that what you're 13 13 between 2002 and the end of 2008, if you know? 14 14 A. One of your documents said 846, and that Q. Those could be examples of what I'm 15 was around 2004, 2005, so 2002 there would've been 15 asking. less than that. And 2008, there would've been A. Those examples exist, so, yes. 17 17 more than that. Q. And when a coupon is issued, for 18 18 Q. It's fair to say there are hundreds of example, is that something that would be valid at 19 Publix stores at all times relevant here? all Publix stores? 20 20 A. Yes, sir. A. It would depend. 21 Q. And Publix would use shell eggs --Q. So coupons could be issued that would 22 Publix would not use shell eggs as a loss leader, not impact all Publix stores at the same time, 179 181 let's say, all 846 stores at the same time? correct? MR. GERMAINE: Objection. A. Yes. A. Yes, we could. Q. Okay. You said cost is a major factor BY MR. SCHWINGLER: in the price that Publix charges its customers for Q. It could? shell eggs, correct? A. Yes. A. Yes. Q. But Publix could also use shell eggs as Q. How often does Publix increase or 8 a loss leader for some portion of its stores at a decrease its shell egg prices -- withdrawn. 9 given point in time, correct? Assume shell egg prices were to 10 10 A. Yes, sir. increase. Typically, how long would it, would 11 Q. What factors does Publix consider when 11 Publix wait until increasing its retail price to 12 12 determining whether to offer a promotion on shell the customer for that product? 13 13 MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. 14 A. Supply. 14 A. Again, there's a lot of different 15 15 Q. What do you mean by that? factors involved. 16 A. Is there enough supply to do it. Q. So it's not necessarily the case that if 17 17 Q. Does Publix consider the market price of egg prices go up on Tuesday, Publix will always 18 18 shell eggs when deciding whether to have a increase its shell egg prices the following week? 19 19 promotion? MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. 20 20 A. Cost always has an effect, yes, sir. A. No. 21 21 Q. Does Publix consider its pricing of BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 22 other products or services when determining Q. Does Publix generally try to pass on

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

47 (Pages 182 to 185)

182	184
cost increases to the retail customer for shell	Q. And Publix places a value on the
² eggs?	conditions that the animals that create products
³ MR. GERMAINE: Objection.	Publix then sells to consumers, Publix places a
⁴ A. Um, there's many different factors	value on the way those animals are treated?
⁵ involved.	⁵ A. Yes.
⁶ BY MR. SCHWINGLER:	⁶ Q. Has, has animal welfare been an
Q. So it's not always the case that Publix	important issue to Publix since 1999?
8 would pass along a cost increase to the end	8 A. Yes.
9 consumer, correct?	⁹ Q. All right. Who within Publix is
¹⁰ MR. GERMAINE: Objection. Asked and	¹⁰ (Discussion off Record)
¹¹ answered.	MR. GERMAINE: Is there anyone still on
12 A. Yes.	the phone?
MR. RAYLE: Excuse me. Can I have that	MS. ALLEN: Yes. This is Karri Allen.
14 question back?	l'm still here.
MR. SCHWINGLER: Sure. Can you read the	¹⁵ MR. GERMAINE: Hi, Karri. Sorry.
16 question back?	BY MR. SCHWINGLER:
17 (Reporter complied with above)	Q. I'm going to ask you a question about
¹⁸ MR. RAYLE: And his answer?	job titles. Which employees of Publix are
19 THE WITNESS: Yes.	responsible for animal-welfare-related issues with
²⁰ MR. RAYLE: Thank you.	respect to egg-laying hens in particular?
21 BY MR. SCHWINGLER:	A. Um, answer questions about animal
Q. All right. And I hate to do this again,	welfare issues or or, or assuring that the
183	185
but just, just so I'm can check the box, you	animals are being taken care of? I mean what,
testified that Publix does not distribute shell	what extent are you talking about?
eggs to other companies; is that accurate?	³ Q. Sure. You testified that animal welfare
⁴ A. Yes.	is an important issue for Publix, correct?
5 MR. SCHWINGLER: All right. Is	⁵ A. Yes, sir.
⁶ Mr. Wilson testifying about animal welfare	⁶ Q. So was there somebody within Publix that
7 related issues on behalf of the whole	was responsible for evaluating
8 company? That is one of the topics that he	⁸ animal-welfare-related issues between 1999 and the
⁹ is being designated to cover.	⁹ end of 2008?
MR. GERMAINE: We'd have to look at	A. Um, CQA would be the ones that would be
John's note to you and in the notice.	in charge of the audits of the facilities and
Mr. Wilson is prepared to testify about	12 stuff.
¹³ animal welfare issues.	Q. So CQA would conduct the audits of the
¹⁴ MR. BJORK: Do you know what topics?	suppliers. Was CQA responsible for determining
¹⁵ MR. SCHWINGLER: Um, I'll tell you what,	what animal welfare standards Publix would
¹⁶ we'll just ask him questions and see where it	16 require?
goes.	A. I don't think CQA
18 BY MR. SCHWINGLER:	MR. GERMAINE: Objection to the form.
¹⁹ Q. As a general matter, Mr. Wilson, would	A conducted the audits.
you agree that animal welfare is an important	²⁰ BY MR. SCHWINGLER:
issue for Publix?	Q. They didn't?
²² A. Yes.	A. I think outside companies conducted the
III	I and the second

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

48 (Pages 186 to 189)

188 186 audits. on Tampa Farms Service letterhead, addressed to Q. But CQA instructed the outside companies Mr. Dave Cerra. Are you familiar with Mr. Dave Cerra? to conduct the audits, correct? MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. A. Yes. A. CQA was in charge of making sure that Q. Am I pronouncing that last name the audits got done. correctly? Q. Sure. A. Yes. MR. SCHWINGLER: What exhibit are we on Q. And who is Mr. Cerra? now? A. He was the BDD. 10 THE COURT REPORTER: 15. Q. So he was the most senior Publix 11 11 employee that was responsible for egg procurement? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 12 12 Q. Mr. Wilson, I'm handing you what's been A. In 2002, yes, sir. 13 13 marked as Exhibit 15. It's a one-page document Q. In 2002. If you flip the page to number 14 14 bearing the Bates number PUB_EGGS_008095. 011762, which is a document on Publix letterhead, 15 15 (Wilson 15 Received and Marked) addressed to all Publix egg producers/suppliers, 16 Q. I'll just ask you to review the portion from Dave Cerra dated July 11, 2002. The subject 17 17 of -- this letter is on Rose Acre Farms' line states: "FMI-NCCR Animal Welfare 18 18 letterhead, signed by Greg Hinton, it appears. Guidelines." Are you familiar with this document? 19 And it's addressed, it appears, to Chris Smith. A. Yes, sir. 20 20 Who is Chris Smith? Q. All right. What is this document? 21 A. I'm not sure, sir. A. It's a letter. 22 Q. You're not familiar with Chris Smith? Q. Okay. And what, what is the purpose of 187 189 A. It says purchasing analyst on here. this letter? Q. Are you familiar with that job title? A. It's a letter to all the egg companies A. No, sir. about animal welfare. Q. So I take it that you're not aware of Q. Okay. And if you'd go down to the why Rose Acre Farms would be communicating with middle of the page where it says "action" on the Chris Smith about the subject matter of this left side? letter; is that correct? A. Yes, sir. A. It would have to do with -- what's the Q. And there's a paragraph to the right of date on this? I don't see a date on here. So I that. The paragraph reads: "As a supplier to 10 can't, I can't decide what it's about. Without a Publix, we are requesting that you agree to follow 11 date or anything else, I would --11 the guidelines as set forth in the above-mentioned 12 Q. Sure. report." Do you see that? 13 13 A. -- assume it would be around the time A. Yes, sir. 14 they were doing an auction or something, but --14 Q. And if you go up to the section above on 15 Q. Sir, you can set that exhibit aside. background, the first sentence says: "On June 16 16 MR. SCHWINGLER: 16? 27th, 2002, the Food Marketing Institute and the 17 17 (Wilson 16 Received and Marked) National Council of Chain Restaurants publically 18 18 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: released the FMI-NCCR Animal Welfare Report." do 19 19 Q. Mr. Wilson, we've handed you what's you see that? 20 20 marked as Exhibit 16, which is a two-page A. Yes, sir. 21 21 document, bearing the Bates range PUB_EGGS_011761 Q. And so do you understand the sentence to 011762. The first page appears to be a letter below on the page that we just read, that refers

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

49 (Pages 190 to 193)

190 192 to the above-mentioned report, do you understand Q. Do you now recall what it means? the phrase "above-mentioned report" to be A. You just said it's National Council of referring to the FMI-NCCR Animal Welfare Report? Chain Restaurants. A. Yes. Q. Is Publix a member of the NCCR as well? Q. Beside the sentence that comes after A. FMI and NCCR is the same group, isn't that says: "Further, Publix needs to receive in it? writing your company's commitment to adhere to Q. Are you familiar with whether FMI and these guidelines." Do you see that? NCCR are separate organizations or are they one A. Yes, sir. organization, to your knowledge? 10 10 Q. So is it your understanding that as of A. To my knowledge, they are one 11 11 July 11, 2002, Publix was requiring its egg organization. 12 12 producers and suppliers to comply with the Q. And just to be clear, Publix has been a 13 13 FMI-NCCR animal welfare Guidelines? member of FMI at all times since 1999, correct? 14 14 A. It says here they were requesting it. 15 15 In the letter, it says we're requesting. It Q. Do you know when Publix became a member 16 doesn't say anything about requiring -of FMI? 17 17 Q. Okay. A. No. 18 18 A. -- according to the letter. Q. Do you know whether Publix employees 19 19 Q. In the next sentence that says: have served in leadership roles within FMI? 20 20 "Further, Publix needs to receive in writing your A. Yes. 21 company's commitment to adhere to these Q. Can you -- around 2002, were any Publix 22 guidelines." What do you understand that sentence employees serving in leadership positions within 191 193 to mean? FMI? A. Yes, sir. A. That if you live up to their request, then we need to receive your letterhead saying Q. Who is that and what role? that you're going to comply to the guidelines. A. I'm not sure. I'm just sure there were. Q. Can you give me an example of a position Q. All right. You can set Exhibit 16 within FMI that a Publix employee has held in the aside, although we're likely come back to it. last, since 1999? Does Publix have any internal committees A. Dan Maloney was a member of FMI. He was or groups that were tasked with monitoring animal on the board. I don't know which position it was, welfare issues? but I know he was on the board. 11 11 Q. Any other examples you're aware of? Q. Did Publix conduct any studies about 12 12 animal welfare issues as they relate to egg-laying A. I'm sure there were a lot of other 13 13 examples. I don't know all of them, no, sir. 14 A. No. 14 Q. Are you familiar with FMIs role, if any, 15 15 Q. Okay. And you testified before that in the development of the United Egg Producer's 16 16 Publix was a member of FMI; is that correct? animal welfare guidelines? 17 17 A. And the national chain, you said it just A. I'm not sure. 18 18 a minute ago, now I know what NCCR means. Q. Are you aware that FMI endorsed the cage 19 19 National Chain and -space requirements of the UEP guidelines? 20 20 Q. National Council of Chain Restaurants. A. Yes, sir. 21 21 A. You asked me what that meant earlier. I Q. Was Publix aware that FMI endorsed the 22 cage space requirements of the UEP guidelines in didn't know what that was, no.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

50 (Pages 194 to 197)

196 194 2002? welfare standards pertaining to egg-laying hens? A. Yes. A. I think we -- Dave Cerra's letter asked Q. Did Publix, in 2002, agree with FMI's for the companies to comply. support for the UEP guidelines? Q. My question, did Publix require A. Yes. suppliers to comply with animal welfare standards for egg-laying hens? Q. And if you know, why did Publix agree with FMI support for the UEP guidelines? A. Um, it wasn't really an issue. Q. Why -- when you say it wasn't really an A. We thought it was right. Q. You say "we thought it was right." Are issue, what do you mean? 10 10 you referring to Publix as a company? A. They all complied before we asked them. 11 11 A. Yes, sir. Q. So Publix was never in a position where 12 12 Q. And when you say "we thought it was it had to issue an ultimatum to a supplier? 13 13 right", can you explain a little bit more what you A. No. sir. mean by right? Q. At any point in time between 1999 and 15 A. We were being told that was the right 15 the end of 2008, did Publix require its supplier 16 16 thing to do. of private label liquid eggs to comply with animal 17 17 Q. The right thing to do for the hens? welfare standards? 18 18 A. Yes. A. Um, again, it was a non-issue. 19 Q. Was it Publix's understanding that hens (Wilson 17 Received and Marked) 20 20 that are provided more cage space, are more BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 21 21 Q. Mr. Wilson, we've handed you what's been humanely treated? 22 22 A. That's what we're being told. marked as Exhibit 17, which is a multi-page 195 197 Q. And who is telling you that? document bearing the Bates range PUB_EGGS_008104-008107. And I'll ask you to read A. The egg producers. Q. Can you identify specifically which egg just the first page of that document. The first producers were communicating that to Publix? page, for the Record, appears to be an e-mail from Mark Miley to several individuals on August 14th, A. No, sir. Just the egg producers in 2002. Subject line is Animal Welfare general. Guidelines-Papetti's. Q. Was FMI advocating the cage space A. Yes, sir. requirements as being --A. According to their documents, they were. Q. Okay. The second paragraph states: "As 10 Q. So FMI was, FMI was communicating to background, we have requested and (along with the 11 11 meat department and other manufacturing Publix that increased cage space improved the 12 12 welfare of the laying hens, correct? facilities), have requested that all suppliers of 13 13 A. I think they were, they were meat or direct animal by-products to provide a 14 communicating that to the food market industry. 14 letter, signed by a company official, stating they 15 15 Not just Publix. will adhere to the animal welfare guidelines 16 16 proposed by FMI." Do you see that? Q. Okay. But Publix did receive those 17 17 communications. A. Yes. 18 A. I'm sure they did, yes, sir. We're part Q. The first sentence of the next paragraph 19 19 of the food market industry. reads: "Unfortunately, Papetti's response was 20 20 Q. At any point in time between 1999 and less than we hoped for." Do you see that? 21 21 the end of 2008, did Publix require its suppliers A. Yes. of shell eggs to comply with any set of animal Q. And then the paragraph goes on to state,

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

51 (Pages 198 to 201)

198 200 quote: "They claim they would be unable to MR. SCHWINGLER: Oh, sure. provide us with the requested letter unless they MR. GERMAINE: Just for the Record, I think this relates to MSP suppliers and you were to increase the cost of our products." Do can continue to ask the witness questions you see that? A. Yes. about it. THE WITNESS: It has nothing to do with Q. Okay. Next paragraph down: "We have grocery products. That's okay. not had this type of response from any of our suppliers, including those of our retail eggs." MR. SCHWINGLER: Okay. Do you see that? MR. GERMAINE: I don't believe there's 10 10 A. Yes. ever any business between Michael Foods and 11 11 Q. And then the next sentence says: "The Publix on the retail side. 12 12 unfortunate consequence of Papetti's failing to BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 13 13 meet our requirements would be the need to Q. Sure. But the -- there was business 14 14 between Papetti's and Publix, correct? transition our egg business to another supplier." 15 15 Do you see that? A. Yes. 16 A. Yes. Q. My understanding of this e-mail is that 17 17 Q. Do you understand that -- this sentence Publix is stating that because Papetti's cannot 18 18 comply with the FMI welfare guidelines without to mean that at this point in time, in 2002, Publix was requiring its egg suppliers to comply increasing its cost, that Papetti's is failing to 20 20 with the FMI guidelines? meet Publix's requirements and is therefore going 21 21 MR. GERMAINE: Objection. Asked and to lose their business with Publix. Do you have a 22 22 different understanding? answered. 199 201 Q. You can answer. MR. GERMAINE: Objection. MR. GERMAINE: Do you want the question A. My understanding is that they want to raise costs in order to meet the FMI guidelines. A. It still says we've requested. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Well, you are not -- you did not receive Q. Just turning specifically to the phrase this e-mail, correct? "our requirements". A. No, sir. A. Yes, sir. Q. You haven't seen this e-mail before Q. You would agree that this e-mail is today, correct? talking about the FMI animal welfare guidelines, A. No. It's the first time I've read it. 11 correct? 11 Q. All right. Let's set it aside. We 12 12 talked about cage space. Other than cage space A. Yes, sir. 13 13 Q. And that the e-mail then discusses that per hen, are you familiar with any animal welfare 14 14 Michael Foods is unable to comply with those requirements that Publix imposes on its egg 15 15 guidelines unless they increase the cost of their suppliers? Let me rephrase it the other way. A 16 16 products; is that correct? different way. 17 17 A. Yes, sir. Is Publix aware that the, the UEP 18 18 MR. GERMAINE: Objection. It says guidelines also regulate back filling of cages? 19 19 A. Um, I don't. Papetti's. 20 MR. SCHWINGLER: I'm sorry. What did I 20 Q. Are you familiar with the term "back 21 21 filling"? MR. GERMAINE: Michael Foods. A. No, sir.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

52 (Pages 202 to 205)

202 204 Q. Are you familiar with, with beak A. Yes, sir. trimming? Q. And so would you agree that by July 11, 2002, compliance with the FMI Animal Welfare A. Yes. Q. Is Publix aware that the UEP guidelines Guidelines was required of all Publix egg regulate beak trimming of laying hens? suppliers, correct? A. Yes. MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. Q. Is Publix aware that the UEP guidelines A. We're requesting it in July, yes. And regulate the ammonia levels in a house? Hen we're still doing business with somebody in August house? that is not compliant, according to --10 10 A. No. Q. Where are you seeing that? 11 11 Q. Between 1999 and the end of 2008, were A. According to 17. This is August 14th, 12 12 there any aspects of the UEP certified program 2002. 13 13 that Publix believed were particularly significant Q. Returning to Exhibit 16, the sentence 14 14 that I just read, "in keeping with Publix's desire or important? 15 15 MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. to set higher standards in all our business 16 A. Um, no. endeavors and to fully meet the needs of the 17 17 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: communities we serve", did Publix impose this 18 18 Q. Let's see if we can just turn back to request or requirement for the FMI Animal Welfare 19 19 Exhibit 16 and the second page of that document Guidelines -- withdrawn. 20 20 briefly. Would you agree that the sentence that I 21 I'll direct your attention to the just read accurately states the reason why Publix 22 22 paragraph entitled "Background". The third sent this letter in July 11, 2002 to its egg 203 205 sentence of that paragraph reads: "In keeping suppliers? with Publix's desire to set a higher standard in A. To exceed the standards, highest all our business endeavors and to fully meet the standards possible. needs of the communities we serve, Publix has Q. That Publix has a desire to set a higher adopted the FMI-NCCR Animal Welfare Guidelines as standard; is that correct? the standard requirement for all vendors to follow A. Yes. in dealing with animal welfare." Q. And Publix has a desire to fully meet Do you see that? the needs of the communities it serves, correct? A. Yes. 10 10 Q. Does this refresh your recollection on Q. And those -- it's those objectives --11 whether Publix was requiring vendors to comply 11 would you agree that it's those objectives that 12 12 with the FMI Animal Welfare Guidelines? led Publix to send this remember to its egg 13 13 A. Again, in the letter, it states that suppliers in July of 2002, correct? 14 we're requesting them to, to follow the 14 A. Yes. 15 15 Q. Do you know who at -- within Publix was 16 16 responsible for making the decision to send out Q. The sentence that I just read, you would 17 17 agree states that Publix has adopted the FMI-NCCR this letter in Exhibit 16 in 2002? Animal Welfare Guidelines as the standard A. Dave Cerra's name is on the letter. 19 19 requirement for all vendors to follow in dealing Q. But you're not familiar -- you're not 20 20 with animal welfare. aware of who made the decision to actually send 21 21 A. Yes. the letter? A. Dave Cerra wrote the letter and sent it. Q. Do you agree with that?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

53 (Pages 206 to 209)

206 208 So he would've been the one that made the decision BY MR. SCHWINGLER: to, to send the letter. He was the business Q. I've handed you what's been marked as development director in charge. Exhibit 18, which is a one-page document with a Q. Dave Cerra is not the most senior Bates number PUB_EGGS_012953. At the top of the employee or was not the most senior employee document, it says Publix Super Markets. And within Publix at that time? underneath the grid on the left side of the page, A. No, sir. There's, there were -- there's it says: "Price -- Prices increased two cents per a lot of people that are higher than BDDs, but the dozen, 2-24-03 for animal welfare issues." Do you BDDs are in charge of their, their categories. see that? 10 Q. When you say Dave Cerra made the A. Yes. 11 11 decision, are you making that statement based on Q. Is this a reference to the two-cent 12 12 the fact that Dave Cerra signed the letter or do surcharge you just testified about? 13 you have other -- another basis for that A. Yes. 14 14 testimony? Q. Okay. And so, did that surcharge go 15 15 A. His signature. into effect on February 24th, 2003? Q. Okay. So other than the fact that A. Um, yes. 17 17 Mr. Cerra signed that letter, you are not aware of Q. Do you know how long Publix was paying a 18 18 who decided to send that letter to customers? two-cent surcharge for certified eggs? 19 A. No. sir. A. I believe we still are. 20 20 Q. From 2002 to the end of 2011, do you Q. Is that true for all of the, all of the 21 know the approximate percentage of shell eggs shell egg purchases? 22 purchased by Publix that were produced in A. Yes. Not -- that's Publix brand. 207 209 compliance with the UEP certified program? That's not the national brand. A. From 2002 until 2011? Q. Okay. Did Publix pay a Q. Until the end of 2008. two-cent-per-dozen surcharge on national brand A. I would, I would guess one hundred shell eggs? A. It was included in their cost if we did. percent, but it depends on when our -- all of our egg suppliers became compliant. If they were I told you already we just paid cost for the national brand eggs. compliant in 2002, then we would've gotten all of Q. Okay. So -our eggs, one hundred percent of them. A. It's not a formula-based price. Q. Is your testimony the same for 2008 10 10 until present? Q. Did the suppliers of national brand 11 A. Yes. 11 shell eggs request or -- withdrawn. 12 12 Q. Are UEP certified eggs more expensive Did the suppliers of national brand 13 13 for Publix to purchase than non-UEP certified shell eggs ever communicate to Publix that they 14 eggs? 14 were increasing the prices they were charging as a 15 15 A. There was a surcharge associated with result of compliance with the animal welfare 16 16 guidelines? it. 17 17 Q. Do you recall what that surcharge was? A. Not that I'm aware of. A. Two cents a dozen. Q. All right. You can set Exhibit 18 19 19 Q. All right. And I -aside. 20 20 MR. SCHWINGLER: Is this Exhibit 18? MR. SCHWINGLER: Let me know when you 21 21 THE COURT REPORTER: Yes. guys need a break. MR. GERMAINE: I think it's probably a (Wilson 18 Received and Marked)

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

54 (Pages 210 to 213)

210 212 good time if you're at a good spot. included in the cost of the goods. So it's still MR. SCHWINGLER: Yeah, now is as good a a surcharge in the cost of the goods, correct? time as any. It's just included in the cost of the goods. MR. GERMAINE: Okay. Q. I guess the broader question, are you THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 2:32. We're aware, as you sit here, whether Publix is paying a going off the Record. two-cent surcharge for animal welfare compliant (Proceedings recessed at 2:32 p.m.) eggs? (Proceedings resumed at 2:45 p.m.) A. Yes. THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 2:45. We're Q. You are. And is Publix paying a 10 back on the Record. 10 two-cent surcharge? 11 11 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: A. It's included in the cost of the goods. 12 Q. Mr. Wilson, we've handed you what's been (Wilson 20 Received and Marked) 13 marked as Exhibit 19. It's a document bearing the 13 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 14 Bates range PUB_EGGS_006846 and running until 14 Q. Mr. Wilson, I've handed you what's been 15 006851. 15 marked as Exhibit 20, which is a document bearing 16 (Wilson 19 Received and Marked) 16 the Bates range PUB_EGGS_007158 through 007182. 17 BY MR. SCHWINGLER 17 I'll direct your attention to the page numbered 18 Q. The first page of the document says at 18 007166. 19 the top, Publix Brand Eggs and then Current Costs. 19 MR. RAYLE: Excuse me. What was the 20 Are you familiar with this document? 20 number again, Counsel? The exhibit number? 21 A. This is the first time I've seen it. 21 MR. SCHWINGLER: Exhibit 20. 22 Q. Okay. My only question for this 22 MR. RAYLE: Okay. 211 213 MR. SCHWINGLER: You can go off the document, if you look down below the grid, and you see in italics: "Quotations must include all Record. costs associated with necessary animal care THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 2:51. We're certifications." Do you see that? going off the Record. (Stood at Ease) A. Yes, sir. Q. So is this consistent with your earlier THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 2:52. We're testimony that for Publix -- I'm sorry. These are back on the Record. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Publix brand eggs, you'd agree? Q. Mr. Wilson, the portion of Exhibit 20 A. Yes. 10 10 Q. Okay. So earlier, I thought you had I'm asking you to look at begins on page 7166 and 11 testified that for Publix brand eggs, Publix was 11 continues on to page 7167. Appears to be a letter 12 12 still paying a two-cent surcharge for animal from, letter addressed to someone named Steve from 13 13 welfare guidelines. Tampa Farm Service. Was Tampa Farm Service a 14 14 A. Yes, sir. supplier of shell eggs to Publix? 15 15 Q. Would you agree that the statement on A. Yes. 16 16 Q. And that was until they were acquired by this document would indicate that animal welfare 17 17 costs would be included in the quotation, itself? somebody else; is that correct? A. Yes. A. That's what it looks like. 19 Q. Does that refresh your recollection at 19 Q. On page 7166, I'd like to direct your 20 20 all about whether Publix is still paying a attention to the portion of the document -- first 21 21 two-cent-per-dozen surcharge? of all, do you recognize this document? A. That's the first I've seen it. A. I guess it's not a surcharge. It's just

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

55 (Pages 214 to 217)

214 216 Q. First time you've seen it. Do you know Q. How would you interpret this letter? who Steve --A. I'd interpret it as that's their spin on A. Yes, sir. the quotation. But that's not what I agree with. Q. Who is Steve? This is their letter to us so, of course, they're A. Steve Hicks. He's been in other going to spin it that they're not making as much e-mails. as they need to be making. But, no, I don't -- I mean, if you read through this right here, it Q. And Steve Hicks is with MSP, correct? A. He was, yes, sir. talks about the -- there's many sentences in here Q. Was. So you would agree that this is a, about competitive nature of the marketplace and 10 10 a letter from a shell egg supplier to the head of how there's more eggs in the marketplace than 11 11 MSP, correct? there needs to be in the southeast. I mean, it's 12 12 A. No. Steve's not the head. all in this letter. So that all goes into the 13 13 Q. Not the head? cost of goods. 14 14 A. He was in charge of the --Q. Did Tampa Farm Service supply Publix 15 15 Q. Category review? brand shell eggs? A. Yes, sir. A. Yes. 17 17 Q. So this is a letter from a shell egg Q. And you testified earlier that Publix 18 18 buys its Publix brand shell eggs off of an Urner supplier to a Publix employee that was involved in 19 19 the category review process for shell eggs, Barry quote, correct? 20 20 correct? A. Yes. 21 21 Q. Now does Publix negotiate a -- do they A. Yes, sir. 22 Q. Okay. Under the, under question number pay what the quote -- withdrawn. 215 217 three, the document reads: "We thought we had Does Publix negotiate a discount off of provided you with a very competitive quotation the Urner Barry market for -when we returned our DSD bid forms on January 7, A. Exhibit 18 --2005, having returned almost the entire two-cent Q. -- shell eggs? Yes. A. Exhibit 18. pricing basis increase that Publix allowed its egg suppliers two years ago when the Animal Care Q. Yep. What about Exhibit 18? A. There's our cost right there. Certified program was implemented." Do you see Q. So are you indicating that Exhibit 18, that that grid reflects the discount off of the A. Yes. 10 Q. There's sort of an italicized market price? 11 parenthetical discussion and the letter picks up: 11 A. At that time on 2-24-03, yes, sir. 12 12 "Therefore, we felt that reducing our bid to Q. Okay. But the price that Publix was 13 13 essentially 'give back', end quote, that initial paying at a given point in time for a shell egg 14 price increase, while still facing those very real 14 that would become a Publix brand shell egg, that 15 15 ACC program costs, would result in a very was determined based on a negotiated discount off 16 16 competitive quote." Do you see that? of the Urner Barry market, correct? 17 17 A. Yes. A. Yes, sir. Q. Would you agree this correspondence Q. Okay. Did -- I just need you to explain 19 19 suggests that Tampa Farm Service was no longer to me, you've testified if Publix is still paying 20 20 charging a two-cent surcharge for animal welfare a two-cent surcharge for welfare eggs. Is that 21 21 eggs at this point in time? something that's added on to the price after the A. No, I would not agree with that. discount is imposed?

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

Wilson, James

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

20

21

August 29, 2013

220

221

56 (Pages 218 to 221)

218

A. It was in '03. Now it's just included in the cost.

Q. Now it's just sort of, whatever the discount happens to be for a given supplier, um, that discount is two cents less than it would've been but for the animal welfare program?

A. Could be more than two cents because the animal welfare program. There's less supply now.

Q. So is it your, is it your testimony that the cost increase resulting from the welfare program, has been --

A. Passed on?

Q. -- incorporated into the market price, itself?

A. Now, yes, sir.

Q. Okay. But it's not incorporated into the discount that Publix would negotiate relative to the market price, correct?

A. No, sir.

Q. Okay. I'm sorry. That -- that could be an ambiguous question. When you say no, sir, are you testifying that the two-cent surcharge is not

these documents here, brought to Dave Cerra's attention that the UEP was going to impose these guidelines and that animal welfare was a hot

button issue. It was going to cost them more money because they were going to be less

efficient. So that they were going to need to charge us a surcharge to help cover that cost.

Q. Did Publix understand why shell egg producers would be less efficient under the animal welfare guidelines?

A. Um, we understood that there would be less birds. And like I said, Mike Bynum brought that information to, to Dave Cerra. Mike Bynum was a long-time supplier for Publix Super Markets

Q. Does Publix currently support the elimination of the UEP certified program?

A. Um, there needs to be some kind of program. I don't know if the UEP program is the right one or not. I don't know if I'm -- I don't think we really have a -- there needs to be some kind of standard.

Q. Publix's position is that there, there

219

included in the discount? That Publix would negotiate with the supplier?

MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. BY MR. SCHWINGLER:

Q. Yeah. Let me break it this down into its parts.

So as I understand it, there's two components to the price that Publix pays for shell eggs that become Publix branded shell eggs.

There's the Urner Barry quote and there's a negotiated discount; is that correct?

A. Yes.

Q. Okay. Is it your testimony that the costs of the animal welfare programs are now accounted for by the Urner Barry piece of that price?

A. Yes.

Q. Okay. Thank you. Why did Publix agree to a two-cent surcharge in 2003 for animal welfare certified eggs?

A. It's my recollection that Mike Bynum, who was in charge of Tampa Farms, is in some of

ought to be a set of guidelines that regulate how laying hens are treated?

A. Animal welfare in general, yes, sir.

Q. Does Publix believe that egg-laying hens should receive a minimum amount of floor space in cages?

A. We're not scientists, so we can't make that determination.

Q. If scientists were to recommend a minimum amount of floor space in cages, would Publix -- is it Publix's position that egg-laying hens should be given a scientifically justified amount of cage space?

MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form.

A. I can't answer that question.

BY MR. SCHWINGLER:

Q. Do you not understand the question?

A. I understand what you're saying, but I've already told you, we can't make that determination.

Q. Sure. So to be clear, what I'm looking for is what Publix's position is. So when you say

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

57 (Pages 222 to 225)

222 224 "I can't answer the question", I just need to -- I A. No. sir. need to rephrase it in a way you can answer it or Q. Did Publix have any contact with Sparboe I need to get an answer. So if the answer is "I Farms about animal welfare issues? don't know", that's fine. But can we -- let me A. No, sir. USDA does have guidelines, so just reask it. I would have to say that USDA guidelines do. Does Publix believe that egg-laying hens Q. When you say the USDA has guidelines, should be given an amount, a minimum amount of what are you referring to? USDA guidelines. cage space -- withdrawn. Does Publix believe that egg-laying hens Q. Are those regulations that apply to all 10 10 should receive a scientifically justified amount hens in the country? 11 11 A. Yes. of cage space? 12 12 MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. Q. Okay. Are you -- are you familiar with 13 13 A. Publix believes that egg-laying hens the USDA Process Verified Program? 14 14 should be treated humanely. 15 15 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. So when you're referring to USDA 16 16 Q. And what -- to Publix, what does the guidelines, you're not referring to the Process 17 17 term "humanely" mean? Verified Program? 18 18 A. Proper treatment. A. No. sir. 19 Q. And proper treatment as defined by who? Q. Did any -- has Publix had any contact 20 20 A. Governing body. with Ken Clippen? 21 21 Q. Would FMI be an example of a governing A. No, sir. Not that I'm aware of. No, 22 22 body that would define the proper standards for sir. 223 225 treating hens? Q. At any point between 1999 and the end of 2008, was Publix contacted by activist groups A. They have in the past. Q. Is Publix -- start over. Has Publix, at regarding the treatment of egg-laying hens that any point between 1999 and the end of 2008, did supplied Publix with shell eggs? Publix contact anyone about animal welfare A. Yes. programs other than the UEP certified program? Q. Which groups contacted Publix? MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. A. PETA. Q. When did PETA contact Publix? MR. SCHWINGLER: Can I get a clarification of the objection? A. Between those time periods. 10 MR. GERMAINE: It lacks foundation. Q. Any other groups? 11 11 We've never established that any exists. A. The American Humane Society -- no. The 12 12 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: **Humane Society of the United States.** 13 13 Q. Is Publix aware of any animal welfare, Q. Do you know when the Humane Society 14 programs other than UEP certified program, between 14 contacted Publix about egg-laying hens? 15 1999 and the end of 2008? A. During that time period also. 16 16 Q. The time period I identified was 1999 A. For laying hens? 17 17 Q. For laying hens. through the end of 2008, correct? A. Yes. A. No, sir. 19 19 Q. So was Publix aware that Defendant Q. Can you provide anymore specificity 20 20 about when PETA or the Humane Society contacted Sparboe Farms was pursuing an alternative animal 21 21 welfare program at various point in time between Publix about egg-laying hens? 2002 and 2008? A. No.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

58 (Pages 226 to 229)

226 228 Q. Do you know whether PETA or the Humane Q. Beyond the fact that it's a periodical, Society contacted Publix about animal welfare are you familiar with the subject matter of the issues prior to July 2002? publication? A. I'm sure they did. A. It talks about grocery. Q. Does Publix monitor activists --Q. Is this a, is this a periodical that withdrawn. Publix would receive on a regular basis? Does Publix monitor what animal rights activists say with respect to Publix's Q. And when is this article, or when is competitors? For example, can you give me an this particular issue dated? I think on the front 10 10 example of a competing grocery chain that Publix page it says January 1st, 2002; is that correct? 11 11 considers to be one of its competitors? A. Yes. 12 12 A. Kroger. Q. If you look on the second page, numbered 13 13 Q. Kroger. At any point between 1999 and 6506, there's two columns in the article on the 14 14 the end of 2008, did Publix monitor whether animal right column -- the second full paragraph in the 15 15 rights groups were interacting with Kroger about right column beginning with the word "after" 16 animal welfare issues? states: After declaring victory over McDonald's, 17 17 A. No, sir. Monitor, no, sir. Burger King and Wendy's, PETA turns its attention 18 18 Q. Would you use a different word than to the records of other companies including ten of 19 19 monitoring? the nation's largest grocery retailers." Do you 20 20 see that? A. No, sir. 21 21 Q. Was -- at any point between 1999 and the A. Yes. 22 22 end of 2008, did Publix receive information Q. At this point, was -- in January of 227 229 regarding whether animal rights groups were 2002, was PETA contacting Publix about animal contacting any of Publix's competitors? welfare issues? A. Yes. A. Yes, I'm sure they were. We've already Q. Can you give me an example? established that. A. Newspaper articles. Q. You go on to the next statement: On its (Wilson 21 Received and Marked) vegetarian campaign web site goveg.com, PETA urges THE COURT REPORTER: 21. consumers not to shop at Albertson's, Costco, BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Kroger, Meijer, Publix, Safeway, Super Value, Q. Mr. Wilson, I've handed you what's been Wal-Mart and Winn Dixie until they agree to meet 10 marked as Exhibit 21, which is a document bearing or exceed the standards set in the group 11 the Bates range PUB_EGGS_006505 through 006507. 11 settlement with McDonald's." Do you see that? 12 On the front page appears to be an issue of a A. Yes. 13 13 Q. Was Publix familiar with an agreement publication called the Progressive Grocer dated 14 January 1st, 2002. 14 between McDonald's and PETA at that point in time 15 Mr. Wilson, are you familiar with this related to animal welfare issues? 16 16 A. It was in the news. particular document? 17 17 A. This periodical? Q. Does this article generally demonstrate 18 Q. Yes. Sorry, yeah. First things first. the types of pressure that Publix was receiving 19 19 Are you familiar with the Progressive Grocer? from animal welfare activists in early 2002 20 20 related to egg-laying hens? 21 21 Q. What is Progressive Grocer? A. Would you repeat that, please? A. It's a periodical. MR. SCHWINGLER: Could you read it?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

59 (Pages 230 to 233)

230 232 (Reporter Complied with Above) Q. At the bottom of the first page under number five, one of their demands appears to be: Q. You can set that aside. "Stop buying eggs from suppliers that give hens (Wilson 22 Received and Marked) less than 85 square inches of space per bird." Do BY MR. SCHWINGLER: you see that? A. Yes. Q. Mr. Wilson, you've been handed what's Q. Is that an example of a demand Publix been marked as Exhibit 22, which is a document bearing the Bates range PUB_EGGS_ 011786 through would consider to be unreasonable? A. No, sir. But I do, I do see where they 011788. And at the top of the first page, the 10 10 document appears to be a correspondence from have on here: "Publix suppliers cram hens into 11 11 cages with about as much space per bird as Animal Rights Foundation of Florida, Inc. To 12 12 one-half sheet of standard paper. Tens of Charles Jenkins, Jr., CEO, Publix Super Markets, 13 13 thousands of birds in filthy ammonia-laden sheds Inc. dated August 10th, 2001. 14 14 This abuse, which is illegal in much of Europe and Have you seen this letter before? 15 has been deemed cruel by the entire European A. No, sir, I have not. 16 16 Union, must be phased out." Q. Are you familiar with the Animal Rights 17 They don't want us having any eggs out 17 Foundation of Florida? 18 of cages, period, which is unreasonable. They A. Yes. 19 also sustained. Q. Between 1999 and the end of 2008, to the 20 (Conference call announcer interrupts) 20 best of your knowledge, how often did Publix 21 receive correspondence from the Animal Rights A. (continuing) They also say in number 22 Foundation of Florida relating to egg-laying hens? 231 A. How many times did you say? six: "Stop buying eggs from suppliers that starve Q. Yeah, let me rephrase that. Are you and dehydrate hens in order to increase egg aware of any other correspondence from the Animal production. A process known as forced moulting. Rights Foundation of Florida to Publix between Outlawed in Europe, this process used to force" -1999 and 2008 that relates to the welfare of no one does forced moulting. egg-laying hens? "Buy only chickens raised truly free roaming." That's kind of unrealistic. There's A. I'M not aware of any, but I'm sure we not enough land space to supply enough chickens did. They're a big part of Florida. Q. Would you, would you agree that Animal for free roaming. 10 Rights Foundation of Florida is a well-known group They talk about do not debeak chickens. 11 within Florida? 11 If you don't debeak chickens, they rip each other 12 12 A. Um, I don't know how well known they apart. 13 13 are. They have 4,000 members. There's just a lot of unrealistic 14 Q. Would you -- does Publix take seriously 14 demands in this letter. So, no, 85 square inches, 15 15 the viewpoints of the Animal Rights Foundation of I'm not saying that's unnecessarily unrealistic, 16 16 Florida? but there's a lot of unrealistic parts of this 17 17 A. If they are a Publix customer, we take letter when you look at it as a whole. every viewpoint seriously. But I mean, their, Q. This letter was sent in August of 2001, 19 19 their claims or their demands are unreasonable. correct? 20 20 Q. In this letter, you would, you would A. Yes, sir. 21 21 state that their demands were unreasonable? Q. So that's before Publix requested that 22 its egg suppliers comply with the FMI welfare A. Yes, sir.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

60 (Pages 234 to 237)

234 236 guidelines, correct? Q. Does Publix disagree with the statement A. Yes. "that birds in battery cages suffer immensely"? A. Yes. Q. Set that document aside. (Wilson 23 Received and Marked) Q. And if you read, you can read to BY MR. SCHWINGLER: yourself, the final paragraph in this letter. Q. Mr. Wilson, you've been handed what's A. Yes, sir. been marked as Exhibit 23, which is a document Q. Would you agree that this letter, much with a Bates range PUB_EGGS_ 011856 through like the letter five years earlier from the same 011857. Appears to be a letter from the Animal organization, was encouraging Publix to sell only 10 Rights Foundation of Florida to Charley Jenkins, 10 shell eggs or caged-free eggs? 11 11 Jr. CEO, Publix Super Markets, dated October 23rd, A. Yes. 12 Q. That was 2006. Does Publix still 13 I'll give you a moment to review. Once 13 receive pressure from animal rights activists 14 you've had a chance, please let me know. 14 about selling only cage-free eggs? 15 A. Yes, sir. 15 A. Yes. Q. Are you familiar with this document? 16 (Wilson 24 Received and Marked) 17 A. I see it now. 17 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 18 Q. Have you ever seen this document before 18 Q. Mr. Wilson, you've been handed what's today? 19 marked as Exhibit 24, which is a series of 20 A. Not that I'm aware of, no, sir. 20 documents Bates numbered PUB_EGGS_011874 through 21 Q. Are you familiar with the Animal Rights 011877. I'll represent, for Counsel's benefit, 22 Foundation of Florida? 22 these -- this four-page document was actually 235 237 A. The same one from the letter before. produced as four separate files. We believe it's Q. So this is the same organization? a single document, but it was produced as four A. Same 4,000 members. separate files. Q. What is the Publix Green Wise market? I'll specifically direct your attention A. It was a store opening in Tampa. We to the page starting on 011875. If you could read have three Green Wise markets. just the first paragraph that says "Number One, Q. And what is -- what was the, or how is a Stockholder Proposal." Green Wise market different from a regular Publix A. Yes, sir. location? Q. First of all, who is Jerry Schinella, if 10 A. It's, it's not as different now as it you know? 11 was when we opened them, but when we opened them, 11 A. I'm not sure. 12 12 it sold all organic, natural foods. Q. Do you know who Dave Bornmann is? 13 Q. And if you go down to the fourth full A. Yes. sir. 14 14 paragraph starting with "egg-laying hens". It Q. Who is Dave Bornmann? 15 15 states that: "Egg-laying hens in bare wire cages A. Senior vice-president, corporate 16 are the most intensively confined animal in the purchasing. 17 17 United States. The cages are so restrictive that Q. What are his responsibilities, if you 18 birds cannot even stretch their wings, let alone know? 19 19 engage in other natural behaviors such as nesting, A. He's in charge of everything corporate 20 20 perching and dust bathing. Birds in battery cages purchasing. 21 suffer immensely." Do you see that? Q. Would he be superior to the business 22 A. Yes. development director in charge of eggs?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

61 (Pages 238 to 241)

238 240 Q. Are you familiar with this shareholder Q. Do you know who Sam Middlebrook is? resolution? A. Yes. A. Yes. Q. Who is Sam Middlebrook? Q. Are you aware that the shareholders A. He was a business development director actually voted on that resolution? in the meat department. A. I believe they did, yes, sir. Q. Do you know who Tina Johnson is? Q. Did they defeat or approve the A. Yes. resolution? A. Defeated it. Q. Who's that? 10 10 A. She is a -- she's an adviser to Ed Q. Defeated it. If you go down the page, 11 11 Crenshaw do you see the bold line, "Publix's Statement in 12 Q. Who's Ed Crenshaw? 12 Opposition to Stockholder Proposal"? 13 13 A. He is the CEO of Publix Super Markets. A. Yes. 14 14 Q. Was he the CEO of Publix in February Q. And then the second sentence of that 15 15 2009? first paragraph: "However, the Board of Directors 16 16 A. I think February 2009, yes. No, he may recommends a vote against the following 17 17 have been president then instead of CEO. I don't stockholder proposal based on the reasons set 18 18 know the exact date of change over. forth below." Do you see that? 19 Q. Turning back to the next page under the A. Yes. 20 20 Number One Stockholder Proposal, are you familiar Q. And when you go to the bullet point that 21 with what a stockholder proposal is? says eggs, it says: "Eggs. The company purchases 22 22 A. Yes. fresh eggs from suppliers that have implemented 239 241 Q. What would that be? programs in the interest of animal welfare. One A. It's a proposal to make a change in the hundred percent of the eggs purchased by the company are either cage free or certified by the Q. And can a stockholder raise a proposal United Egg Producers, UEP, a trade association to be voted on by all of the stockholders? representing most US egg farmers and companies. A. Yes. The UEP Certified Program Standards are the Q. And this would occur at an annual strictest in the industry." Do you see that? A. Yes. meeting? Q. So is it true that Publix management A. Yes. 10 Q. Going down the page a bit, it says in opposed the shareholder proposal at issue in this 11 bold, "Shareholder Resolution Regarding Animal 11 e-mail, correct? 12 12 Welfare Progress Report." Do you see that? 13 13 A. Yes, sir. Q. And in explaining why the proposal 14 Q. Okay. It says: "Resolved, that 14 should be voted down, Publix referred to the UEP 15 15 shareholders request that the Board of Directors Certified Program, correct? 16 16 A. Yes. issue a report detailing any progress made toward 17 17 adopting animal welfare policies pertaining to the Q. And Publix stated that it purchases its eggs from UEP certified companies or from cage purchase of pork, eggs and poultry. The report 19 should be proposed by October of 2009 and should 19 free, correct? 20 20 exclude proprietary information." Do you see A. Yes. 21 21 that? Q. So as of February of 2009, when this correspondence was written, would you agree that A. Yes.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

62 (Pages 242 to 245)

242 244 in Publix's view, the UEP Certified Guidelines review any materials in preparation for today's provided a satisfactory response to animal rights deposition that addressed antitrust investigations activists' concerns with egg-laying hens? by federal or state law enforcement agencies? MR. GERMAINE: Sorry. Can I get that A. Did I review any materials that back again? addressed antitrust --MR. SCHWINGLER: Yeah. MR. GERMAINE: I'm going to object to (Reporter Complied with Above) that question and counsel you do not answer MR. GERMAINE: You can answer if you're if it reveals substance of communication with counsel. 10 10 A. We used that as a, as a reasoning. Yes. A. I'm not going to answer that question. 11 We did use that as a reasoning for animal welfare MR. SCHWINGLER: As the witness is 12 12 activists. designated to testify on Publix's behalf -- I 13 13 BY MR. SCHWINGLER: tell you what. Can we go off the Record for 14 14 Q. So just to be clear, Publix relied upon five minutes? Not even. A couple minutes. 15 the UEP certified guidelines in explaining why 15 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 3:32. We're 16 16 additional consideration of animal welfare going off the Record. 17 concerns was unnecessary at that time; is that 17 (Proceedings recessed at 3:32 p.m.) 18 18 Proceedings resumed at 3:34 p.m.) correct? 19 A. In 2009, after 2008? THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 3:34. We're 20 20 Q. Yes. back on the Record. 21 21 A. For this document? BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 22 22 Q. Yes. Q. I apologize, Mr. Wilson. I understand 243 245 A. Yes. that the Defendants did not include the topic of Q. You can set that aside. Was Publix ever contact with law enforcement officials in the contacted by federal or state law enforcement deposition notice to Publix, so you're not officials in connection with any investigation of designated to testify in that behalf. possible antitrust violations regarding the I'm not looking for you to reveal any 6 production or sale of shell eggs? communications with counsel, but if you can, just A. I'd have to rely on our counsel for that answer the following question: Are you aware of whether Publix has had any contact with law one. 9 Q. So you're not aware of whether Publix enforcement officials relating to the 10 10 has -- was contacted by law enforcement officials investigation of possible antitrust violations by 11 11 regarding any investigations of antitrust egg product companies or shell egg companies? 12 12 violations related to shell eggs? MR. GERMAINE: Objection. Asked and 13 13 A. I'd have to rely on our counsel for answered. You can answer if you know. 14 that. 14 A. I don't know. 15 15 Q. When you say "I'd have to rely on our BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 16 16 counsel", are you testifying that you don't know? Q. Okay. Thank you. Does Publix currently 17 17 purchase cage-free eggs? 18 18 Q. So do you, do you know whether Publix --A. Yes. 19 19 A. I don't. I don't know personally. Q. Between 1999 and the end of 2008, did 20 20 Q. You don't know? Publix purchase cage-free eggs at any point in 21 21 A. No, sir. time? Q. Okay. And were you present -- did you A. Yes.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

63 (Pages 246 to 249)

248 246 Q. Are you aware of when Publix decided to THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Our total time at begin purchasing cage-free eggs? this point is 4 hours, 51 minutes -- almost A. After the first supplier brought them to 52 minutes. us and we put them in our stores. MR. SCHWINGLER: Let's go off the Q. Are you aware of when that occurred? Record. A. Actual date that they decided to add THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 3:38. We're them to the -going off record. Q. Ballpark would be fine. (Proceedings recessed at 3:38 p.m.) A. I can't give you a fair answer on that. (Proceedings resumed at 3:52 p.m.) 10 10 Q. Do you know whether it was in the 1990s? THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's 3:52. We're 11 11 A. I would say it was between '90 and 2008. back on the Record. 12 12 That would be a fair ballpark answer. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: 13 13 Q. Between 1990 and 2008? Q. Mr. Wilson, I have just a few more 14 14 A. Somewhere in that time period. questions for you. 15 15 Q. But anything more specific you're not A. Yes, sir. 16 Q. I asked you some questions earlier today 17 17 A. Um, the first time cage-free eggs hit that I ought to have asked from the time period 18 18 our shelves, I could not tell you the date of 1999 through 2008, but I asked from 2002 to 2008. 19 19 So we're not going to go through all of them that, no, sir. 20 20 Q. Do you know who was involved in the again, but I just have a little bit of clean up in 21 21 decision to begin selling cage-free eggs to that respect. 22 22 Publix? Your testimony today has been that 247 249 Publix buys the shell eggs it uses for Publix A. That would be the buyer, the category manager and the business development director. brand shell eggs using a negotiated discount off Q. And are you familiar with what factors of the Urner Barry market price; is that correct? informed that decision? A. Yes. Q. Was that also true from 1999 through A. Customer demand. Cost. Reliability. Product quality. Along with hundreds of other 2002? factors. A. Yes. Q. At any point between 1999 and 2002, did Q. Were Publix's customers demanding that Publix begin selling cage-free eggs? Publix purchase its Publix brand shell eggs on a 10 A. I think there was a demand for the different basis? 11 product. 11 A. No. 12 12 Q. Are cage-free eggs more expensive for Q. I believe you testified earlier that 13 13 Publix to purchase than eggs from caged hens? Publix purchases some national branded shell eggs 14 A. Yes. 14 on a fixed-cost basis: is that correct? 15 15 Q. Did Publix begin selling cage-free eggs A. Yes. 16 16 because other retailers were already selling them? Q. Was that also true between 1999 and 17 17 2002? A. I don't know. A. Yes. MR. SCHWINGLER: I just need, at some 19 19 point to, you know, clear my head and think Q. At any point between 1999 and 2002, did 20 20 if I have anything else to clear up, but I'm Publix purchase the national branded shell eggs on 21 21 sort of done with my principal examination. any basis other than a fixed-cost basis? A. No. How long have we been on the Record?

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

64 (Pages 250 to 253)

250 252 Q. I believe you testified earlier that employees, Publix employees are sometimes in Publix purchases its private label liquid egg leadership positions within FMI; is that correct? A. Yes. substitutes based on a Urner Barry market quote; Q. Are you aware of whether Publix is that correct? A. Yes. employees were involved in discussions with other Q. Was that true between 1999 and 2002? FMI members in the 2001 to 2003 time frame, related to animal welfare issues? A. As far as I know, yes, sir. A. No. Q. And I also believe you testified that Publix purchases national branded liquid egg Q. So you're not aware of whether Publix 10 10 substitutes such as Egg Beaters on a fixed-cost employees were involved in FMIs decision to 11 11 basis; is that correct? endorse the UEP Animal Welfare Guidelines? 12 12 A. Yes. A. I'm not aware, no, sir. 13 13 Q. Was that also the case between 1999 and MR. SCHWINGLER: Okay. I don't have any 14 2002? 14 other questions. 15 A. Yes. 15 MR. GERMAINE: Merrick, do you want to 16 Q. Earlier today, you testified about the go ahead? 17 17 principal shell egg suppliers for Publix and I **CROSS-EXAMINATION** 18 18 believe you noted Hillendale, Tampa Farms, BY MR. RAYLE: 19 19 Cal-Maine and, I may be missing one other, Country Q. Good afternoon, Mr. Wilson. My name is 20 20 Charm? Merrick Rayle and I'm one of the lawyers that 21 represents the indirect plaintiffs in this case. A. Yes, sir. 22 22 Please refer to Exhibit 18. And I'm Q. Were those the principal shell egg 251 253 suppliers for Publix between 1999 and 2002? focused on the sentence below the graph: "Prices A. Yes. increased two cents per dozen 2-24-03 for animal Q. Are there any other shell egg suppliers welfare issues." That was a price charged to that were considered to be a major supplier of Publix, correct? Publix between 1999 and 2002? A. Yes, sir. A. No. Q. Was any -- any part of that increase Q. With respect to -- first of all, did passed on to the retail customer? Publix sell a private label liquid egg substitute A. Um, there's many factors involved. between 1999 and 2002? There's no way of, there's no way of knowing 10 10 A. Yes, sir. I -- let me -- I believe we whether it is or not. 11 did. 11 Q. I believe you testified in response to 12 12 Q. Okay. So at some point, between 1999 my colleague's questions, that there were 13 13 and 2002, Publix sold a private label egg situations in which Publix did pass on increased 14 14 substitute? cost to retail customers. Did I hear that 15 15 A. Yes. I mean, like I said, I believe we correctly? 16 16 did. It may have been before '99 when we started A. Yes, sir. 17 17 Q. I think you also said, although I might Q. Do you recall who the supplier of the have written this wrong, that there were -- there 19 19 private label liquid egg product was between 1999 could be instances in which such increases were 20 20 not passed on; is that correct? 21 21 A. No, sir. I don't recall. A. Yes. Q. Earlier, you testified that Publix Q. And can you tell us what those instances

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

65 (Pages 254 to 257)

254 256 would include? Give us one or two? Mr. Lucas to you dated June 25, 2007, and attached A. Um, just like I told him, they're is part of a spreadsheet reading "New Retail". multiple. It could be market conditions. It Can you explain what this document is? could be competition. It could be, um, any number A. The front page or the back page? of reasons. Q. Both. Q. Okay. Pull Exhibit 14, please. A. The front page is e-mail from James Lucas, just like I said, with an attachment. The A. Yes, sir. Q. What I'm focused on is at page 652. attachment is the Excel spreadsheet on the back, It's the e-mail from Mr. Hicks to Ms. Richardson. which figures out your egg retails for you. I 10 A. Yes, sir. mean, it's just a -- it's a simple Excel 11 11 Q. And under category overview, first spreadsheet. As you plug a price in on Publix 12 12 sentence: "Egg substitutes are not a real 'price large eggs, it populates the rest of the fields. 13 sensitive' item in that they're generally on the Q. Is this the kind of document that your 14 14 company would prepare in the ordinary course of consumer's grocery list as a must rather than 15 15 impulse buy." Do you see that, sir? its business? 16 A. Yes, sir. A. Um, I'm sorry. I'm trying to understand 17 17 Q. Can the same -- can the same be said for your question. 18 18 shell eggs --Q. Is this a document that was prepared A. Um -periodically? 20 20 Q. -- based on your experience? A. No, sir. I use this document every week 21 A. Eggs, eggs are -- shell eggs, I would as I made egg price changes. 22 say, are more price sensitive than liquid eggs. Q. Okay. 255 257 A. So it was -- when James sent it to me Consumers notice the change more readily. That in -- this was right after I started in 2007. I doesn't mean that -- they still, they still have to have it to produce products. But I -- we get started end of June, first of July. So Monday, more push back when egg prices rise -- shell egg June 25th was probably my initial start date. James Lucas sent this document to me and this is prices rise. Does that make sense? Q. It does. I'm going to mark this. the document that I used until I sent it to my (Discussion off Record) predecessor to use to help him price eggs. BY MR. RAYLE: Q. Okay. So the business purpose of the 9 Q. This appears to be an e-mail from document was to help form the price, the retail 10 Mr. James Lucas to you dated June 25, 2007, price of eggs, shell eggs? 11 11 A. Yes, sir. Like I said, all it is a e-mailing new egg retail calculator. 12 12 (Wilson 25 Received and Marked) simple Excel spreadsheet. As you plug in the 13 13 large egg price, it populates the other fields so MR. GERMAINE: I think we have a 14 different document in front of us. 14 that they are all priced the same per egg. 15 15 MR. RAYLE: That's interesting. You do. Q. Thank you. 16 16 Oh, boy. Sorry. Well, let me just let me MR. RAYLE: I think that's all I have 17 17 see what we -for you. Thank you very much. BY MR. RAYLE: THE WITNESS: Thank you. 19 19 MR. GERMAINE: Karri, do you have any Q. I'm sorry, you can put that aside. I 20 don't have any questions about that. I messed up. 20 questions? 21 Let's try this. MS. ALLEN: I do not. Thank you. MR. GERMAINE: Is there anyone else on All right. Now we have an e-mail from

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

66 (Pages 258 to 261)

258 260 the phone? Okay. I have -- do you have some they can try to use against you. redirect? Q. Would you agree it was to Publix's MR. SCHWINGLER: I might have a question competitive benefit that it was able to place the or two about this document. Animal Care Certified logo on shell egg cartons in MR. GERMAINE: Okay. I have just one its stores? MR. GERMAINE: Objection to form. auestion. **CROSS-EXAMINATION** A. Um, I believe it helped with animal BY MR. GERMAINE: rights groups. BY MR. SCHWINGLER: Q. Mr. Wilson, earlier today, you provided 10 10 Q. So you believe that ACC logo or the UEP some testimony about whether or not Publix 11 11 certified logo helped Publix deal with pressure requested its vendors to comply with certain 12 12 from animal welfare groups? animal welfare guidelines. Do you remember that? 13 13 A. Yes. In a certain form, yes. A. Yes. 14 14 Q. And it would've been bad for Publix if Q. What's your understanding of why Publix 15 it was the only major retailer that was not requested vendors to comply with the FMI Animal 16 Welfare Guidelines in 2002 or thereabout? requiring the ACC logo, correct? 17 A. It could've been presented as bad. 17 A. The main reason was because all other 18 18 Q. Coming back to Exhibit 25. supermarkets were complying. We didn't want to be 19 A. Yes, sir. the only one left out. 20 Q. This spreadsheet that you discussed, 20 Q. And how do you know that? 21 this doesn't account for any loss leader A. It was the Food Market Institute that promotions, does it? 22 was implementing it, so all the food markets, or 261 all the food marketers, supermarket chains were, A. No. sir. Q. And it also doesn't really tell us what were adopting those guidelines. Q. Okay. Thank you. prices Publix was charging to its retail MR. GERMAINE: Counsel? customers, does it? REDIRECT EXAMINATION A. This document doesn't, no, sir. This BY MR. SCHWINGLER: document's just generic. It's all it is. Q. Mr. Wilson, you just testified, I Q. It's just something was information for believe, that Publix did not want to be the only you to consider when you were determining what company left out with respect to the FMI Animal prices would be? 10 Welfare Guidelines. When you say "you didn't want A. Like I said, it's an Excel file. So as 11 to be the only one left out", could you just 11 you plug in, see line 303494? 12 explain what you mean by that? 13 13 A. We would be the only supermarket that A. Publix large eggs. Size 12. Under 14 wasn't part of the -- that didn't -- our companies 14 1803, Tampa Farms. 15 didn't conform to the guidelines. 16 16 Q. Why would that be? A. If you plug in a number there, 59 cents 17 17 or 29 cents or a 1.99, whatever number you plug A. Suppliers. 18 Q. Why would that have been a bad thing for in, it will populate the rest of those fields off 19 19 of that number. See how it's 1.49 and medium eggs Publix? 20 20 A. Press, bad press, like you presented on are 1.39 and large eggs are .745? And it's, it's 21 supermarket industries. The animal welfare just a tool to help you get your pricing correct groups, PETA, Animal Rights of America, anything when you enter it into the system.

Wilson, James

August 29, 2013

67 (Pages 262 to 265)

